

PRO&CONTRA

Central European Studies in Humanities

Volume 5

Issue 2

Authors:

Bálint Károlyi

(Eszterházy Károly Catholic University)

Barna Szamosi

(Eszterházy Károly Catholic University)

Saber Qechai

(Eötvös Loránd University)

Eszter Zsuzsanna Csorba

(Eötvös Loránd University)



Líceum Publisher

Eger, 2021

PRO&CONTRA

Central European Studies in Humanities

Editor-in-chief:

Zoltán Peterecz, Eszterházy Károly University, Hungary

Editorial Board

Annamária Kónya, University of Presov, Slovakia

Márk Losoncz, University of Belgrade, Serbia

Ádám Takács, Eötvös Loránd University, Hungary

Language Editor

Geoffrey Vaughan

ISSN 2630-8916 (online)

Managing publisher: Rector of Eszterházy Károly University

Published by Líceum Publisher, EKV, Eger

Head of publisher: Andor Nagy

Managing editor: Ágnes Domonkosi

Layout editor: Gergely Molnár

Year of publication: 2022

Table of Contents

Hiding Patrons or Lords without Patronage? Additions to the Patronage Activity of the Presidents of the Hungarian Chamber with an Outlook on the Habsburg Monarchy (<i>Bálint Károlyi</i>)	5–29
Shifting Concerns of Public Health in Post-Second World War Hungary: From Contagious Diseases to Congenital Disorders (<i>Barna Szamosi</i>)	31–55
Linguistic Rights of Indigenous Peoples in Canada (<i>Saber Qechai</i>)	57–79
The Everlasting Effect of Richard Nixon (<i>Eszter Zsuzsanna Csorba</i>).....	81–97
Review on Mosco Vincent's <i>The Smart City in a Digital World</i> (<i>Saber Qechai</i>)	99–105

BÁLINT KÁROLYI

**Hiding Patrons or Lords without Patronage? Additions to the Patronage
Activity of the Presidents of the Hungarian Chamber with an Outlook on
the Habsburg Monarchy**

Pro&Contra 5

No. 2 (2021) 5–29

<https://doi.org/10.33033/pc.2021.2.5>

Abstract

In the early 16th century Ferdinand Habsburg I implemented a huge financial reform in his lands: the old treasury was turned to a modern chamber system. After 1526, Ferdinand became the king of the Czech lands and a year later the king of Hungary. After his coronation he organised the same financial system in both of these new lands. The new Chambers institutions created new career opportunities for the nobility in the Habsburg states under the rule of Ferdinand I.¹ The reforms of the emperor/king coincided with the beginning of the changing of the nobility in the early 16th century. During the 16-17th century many noble families, who later played an important role in the history of the Hungarian Kingdom, succeeded in ascending and clinging to the aristocracy. One of them was the Zichy family which, thanks to István Zichy (1616–1693), managed to incorporate themselves into the aristocracy by the 1650s. Although research on István Zichy is still in its infancy, it is slowly becoming clearer what role he played in the Hungarian political landscape during the 17th century.²

In my current brief review, I will proceed to detail the life and the correspondence of István Zichy, the president of the Hungarian Chamber (1655–1672), to demonstrate that as chamber president, what kind of patronage did he provide. My main source of information is his correspondence, but I also employ other sources to get a more complete picture. Where it is possible, I have tried to draw a parallel between the work of the protagonist of my article and the activities of the other secular chamber presidents of the 17th century.

Keywords: 17th century, Patronage, Hungarian Chamber, library, book printing, Catholic Church, Habsburg Monarchy

¹ Acsády, Ignác, *Magyarország pénzügyei I. Ferdinánd uralkodása alatt 1526–1564* [The finances of Hungary in the age of Ferdinand I].

² Zichy, István, “Adatok egy XVII. századi katolikus főúri család történetéhez” [Additions to a 17th Century Catholic Aristocrat Family], *Regnum egyháztörténeti évkönyv tomus 5.*, (Budapest, 1942–1943), 734–764.

Brief overview of the Patronage in Hungary during the 16th and 17th centuries

First of all, at the beginning I need to be clear about what I mean by patronage. I think Péter Kőszeghy and György F. Széphelyi successfully summarized the meaning of patronage of arts.³ Based on their work, this article cannot undertake to examine the entire patronage activity, namely due to its large scope. Therefore, I will only review the three major types. These are (1) educating, teaching, and recommending talented people to influential people for offices or other positions, (2) supporting churches, church institutions and individuals, especially artists, (3) and last but not least, publishing various books and publications and the patronage of their preparation.

After I define the limits of the concept of patronage in this work, it must be clarified to which social group István Zichy and the other chamber presidents belonged. Although István Werbőczy explained in his famous work *Tripartitum Regni Hungariae* that all Hungarian nobles are equal, that was not the truth. The nobility was already comprised of many levels.⁴ In my research I concentrated on the aristocracy. But I focus not only on the highest circle of the narrow aristocracy, which included only a dozen families. The chamber presidents in the first two thirds of the 17th century came from the second and third lines of the aristocracy. This group includes those families who, after becoming part of the aristocracy, were created to a baron or a count by the king of Hungary, but the families themselves did not participate in national politics, only were they represented on the political scene by the most prominent member of the family, resulting in a limited significance at the time in Hungary and in the Habsburg Monarchy.⁵ According to the previous research, the chamber presidents of the first two thirds of the 17th century in the Hungarian Kingdom, except for Pál Pálffy, all fall into this category.⁶ But from the last third of the 17th century everything changed, from that time the presidents were selected from the first line of the aristocracy.

³ Kőszeghy, Péter – Széphelyi F., György, *Művészetpártolás* [Patronage of Arts], in *Magyar Művészettörténeti lexikon. Közép és kora újkor* (Budapest, 2004). http://mamul.btk.mta.hu/MAMUL_SZERK/menu.php (accessed: February 11, 2021.)

⁴ Martyn Rady, *The Customary Law of the Renowned Kingdom of Hungary: A Work in Three Parts (the “Tripertitum”) Stephen Werbőczy (Laws of East Central Europe)* (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2005).

⁵ Borbély, Zoltán, A nemesi társadalom struktúrája és a hétköznapi élet keretei Felső-Magyarországon a 17. század első felében [The Structure of the Nobility and the Weekdays in Upper-Hungary during the 17th Century], in *Oszmán-magyar viszony a 16–18. században*. 193.

⁶ We are using the „Chamber President” in general because Tamás Vizkelethy and György Rakoviczky were only directors of the Hungarian Chamber but with the same authority.

Members of this group had limited financial means, most likely sacrificing their wealth to support others in a limited fashion. At the same time, knowing the sad history of the Hungarian archives and the significant destruction of their contents, I do not think it can be ruled out that some families and lords could be revealed to have been unique patrons of their age.⁷ On the other hand, with the current state of research, when opportunities have not been fully exploited even regarding the most significant families, it is understandable that second- and third-line aristocrats have rarely been in the centre of current research.

Based on these, the question what is the situation with the lords arises, as their financial situation would have allowed them, even if they were not at level of a Nádasdy or Esterházy, to afford patronage activities. Could it be that there were lords who would not have taken the opportunity to patronize? Or is it just that they have not been at the forefront of the research? Or perhaps, due to a lack of resources, did we not get to know their actions in this direction?

First, however, I need to give a brief overview of who were the best-known patrons, as well as the fundamental differences between István Zichy, the other prefects of the Hungarian Chamber, and the other nobles of the Hungarian Kingdom. Finally, it is important to determine which branches of patronage in the context of the present work will be the ones we will cover in our work.

Over the years, several research studies have focused on the 16-17th century patronage of the Hungarian, Transylvanian, and Habsburg Monarchy's nobilities. Significant results were achieved in the case of such prominent families in western Hungary as the Nádasdys, the Esterházy, and the Batthyánys.

As an example, the humanist circle formed around Boldizsár Batthyány during the 16th century is well known. The western Hungarian lord generously supported the representatives of various sciences and furthermore, he built a remarkable library.⁸ The Nádasdys, as one of the most important families in the western Hungarian region, also had well-known patronage activity. In the middle of the 16th century Tamás Nádasdy,

⁷ The Hungarian nobility was the second largest after the Polish. In the 16-17th century, the 5% of the population were noble.

⁸ Bobory, Dóra, "Batthyány Boldizsár és humanista köre" [Boldizsár Batthyány Humanist Circle], *Századok*, 139 no. 4. (2005): 923-944.; Koltai, András, *Batthány Ádám és könyvtára* [Adam Batthyány and His Library] (Szeged, 2002); Koltai, András, "Batthyányak udvari zenészei (1627-1664) Adattár" [The Court], 231-244.; Koltai, András, "A Batthyányiak és Carlo della Torre szerződése a rohonci templom építésére" [The Batthyánys and Carlo della Torre's Contract for the Building the Church of Rohonc], *Művészettörténeti értesítő*. 57 (2008): 387-393.

the Palatine of Hungary, appeared as a significant patron of architecture and printing.⁹ The patronage of his great-grandson Ferenc Nádasdy, who became the judge royal (1655–1671), far exceeded the activities of his predecessors, and thus he had a great influence on many of his contemporaries and posteriors.¹⁰ This is well exemplified by the patronage of his brother-in-law, palatine Pál Esterházy.¹¹ Besides these, generous patrons are also known, such as the Rákóczi¹² and the Mágócsy family,¹³ or István Thököly, one of the last Lutheran lords.¹⁴

If we are leaving the circle of the aristocracy, we also find families among the land-owner lesser nobility who were supporting young talents during their studies and travels abroad, or advocating for domestic educational institutions or artists. It is enough to mention István Vitnyédy, who was one of the most significant Lutheran patron of the 17th century.¹⁵ Although members of almost all levels of the society also took part in the patronage to a greater or lesser extent, the most important aspect of my work is the patronage of the aristocracy.

⁹ The Patronage of Tamás Nádasdy: Bartók, István, “A Nádasdy-mecenatúra hatása az irodalmi gondolkodásra” [The Impression of the Nádasdy Patronage on the Literature], in *Nádasdy Tamás (1498–1562)*, ed. Söptei, István, 117–130.; Bartók, István, “Karrier és mecenatúra. Nádasdy Tamás és sárvári udvartartása” [Carrier and Patronage. Thomas Nádasdy and the Court of Sárvár], in *Arisztokrácia, művészetek, mecenatúra*. ed. Czoma, László, 33–43.

¹⁰ Examples for the patronage of Ferenc Nádasdy: Viskolcz, Noémi, *A mecenatúra színterei a főúri udvarban. Nádasdy Ferenc könyvtára* [The stages of patronage in the court of an aristocrat]; Buzási, Enikő, “Gondolatok Nádasdy Ferenc mecenatúrájához, avagy mikor készült az árpási főoltárkép?” [Thoughts to the patronage of Ferenc Nádasdy, or in What Time Was the Altarpiece of Árpás Made?], in *Idővel paloták...* ed. G. Etényi, Nóra – Horn, Ildikó, 582–624.

¹¹ For example: Galavics, Géza, “A mecénás Esterházy Pál. (Vázlat egy pályaképhez)” [The Patron Paul Esterházy. A sketch to a Carrier], *Művészettörténeti értesítő*, 37. no. 3-4. (1988): 136–161.; *Esterházy Pál a műkedvelő mecénás* [Paul Esterházy the Amateur Patron], ed. Ács, Pál, (Budapest, 2015).

¹² Monok, István, *A Rákóczi-család könyvtárai 1588–1660* [The Libraries of the Rákóczi Family] (Budapest, 1996).

¹³ Szabó, András, “Mágócsy Gáspár és András udvara” [The Court of András and Gaspar Mágócsy], in *Magyar reneszánsz udvari kultúra*. ed. R. Várkonyi Ágnes (Budapest, 1987), 272–280.

¹⁴ Szabó, Péter, “A Thököly család és a görög-római kultúra” [The Thököly Family and the Greek-Roman Culture] *Credo*, 11 no 3-4. (2005): 203–210.

¹⁵ That is a well-known fact that István Vitnyédy supported many students on their abroad studies mostly in the German region. Recently two historian worked with his patronage in the field of education. comp. Sárközi, Gergely, “Vitnyédy István és az evangélikus oktatásügy” [István Vitnyédy and the Lutheran Education], *Credo*, 12, no 1-2. (2006), 3–16.; Kónya, Péter, Az arisztokrácia és a nemesség szerepe az eperjesi kollégium alapításában [The Role of the Aristocracy and the Nobility in the Founding of the College of Eperjes], in *Műveltség és társadalmi szerepek*. ed. Bárány, Attila – Orosz, István – Papp, Klára – Vinkler, Bálint (Debrecen, 2014): 361–372.

On the following pages I will work with a small group of aristocrats who represented the second and third line of the aristocracy. This work will show us the differences or similarities between the opportunities of the high nobility in the field of patronage.

Educating and recommending talented people

According to my current research, more than a half thousand letters from István Zichy, written between 1637 and 1693 have survived. The contents of these letters are very diverse. But knowing the career of the author, it can be assumed that the sections on patronage remain on the periphery in the examined documents.

Based on the outlined points, the first areas to be examined are, firstly, those cases when the wealthy patron finances the education and upbringing of talented young people and secondly, those cases of support, recommending persons from the clients of the family.

Unfortunately, only a little information can be found in István Zichy's correspondence on this topic. For the time being, neither I nor the other researchers revealed any talented young people from the circle around Zichy who he would have supported during his chamber presidency (1655–1672) or in a later period. Beside the direct patronage, another, perhaps more cost-effective form of supporting young talents was to employ them as a fellow student or preceptor to accompany the school-age children of a noble family. Sadly, we have no information about the teachers who worked alongside the children of István Zichy. On the other hand, thanks to more recent research, we know his correspondence with his daughter-in-law Kata Károlyi (–1694), which provided interesting additions about the education of his grandchildren. Kata Károlyi, who was the widow of Pál Zichy, was serious about educating her children. She and her brother-in-law István Zichy the younger and her father-in-law often had heated debates regarding the children. At the same time, we also know that the elderly Zichy István selected the preceptors for his grandchildren. Unfortunately, we do not know their names from any of the letters, perhaps because their careers in this role were short, because the children's mother soon got rid of them.¹⁶

Examining István Zichy's correspondence in more detail, so far only one letter is known in which he specifically deals with the recommendation of a person. Johann Baptist Podesta, the renowned Orientalist, who, according to Zichy, was working on a dictionary

¹⁶ Károlyi, Bálint, "Zichy II. Pál árváinak iskoláztatása" [The educating of the orphans of Paul Zichy II], *Aetas*, 34. no. 2. (2019): 60–61.

at the time.¹⁷ The chamber president recommended him to his friend Johann Freiherr von Rottal (1605? –1674) the Privy councilor of the Court in Vienna.¹⁸ Podesta already had a good reputation. He had Italian descents and studied in Rome. After he completed his studies, he travelled throughout the Ottoman Empire, while also reaching the Holy Land. From 1669 he served at the Vienna Military Council (Hofkriegsrat) as an interpreter. Later, he gained remarkable merits by the establishment of interpreter education in Vienna.¹⁹ Unfortunately, in the currently known Zichy-Rottal correspondence, I did not find the continuation of the case or a trace of similar supporting letters.²⁰ This is also true of letters, already revealed which were written to other people. Although the support of relatives, such as of his son-in-law Miklós Andrassy and his efforts to obtain the position of captain of Jász-kun,²¹ or the intervention in the selection of the new abbot of St. Martin (Pannonhalma) cannot be considered as patronizing, but rather as an imprint of his personal political goals.²²

From the period before 1655, when Zichy was the vice-general of the Győr border region, we have some letters in which he patronises certain persons before the lords of the region. For example at the beginning of 1652, György Darabos was recommended to László Esterházy (1626–1652), the captain of Pápa.²³ At the end of the year, the vice-general recommended the son of a local noble widow, to Ádám Batthyány for servant service.²⁴ However, in my opinion, these do not belong to the category of patronage,

¹⁷ Johannes Baptista Podesta, *Dissertatio academica, continens specimen triennialis profectus in linguis orientalibus etc.* (Viennae, Austriae, 1677.) 113–114. Here, I want to say thank you to Prof. István Monok the director of the MTA Library because he recommended to me this important resource.

¹⁸ Johann Rottal's carrier: Henry Frederick Schwarz, *The imperial privy council in the seventeenth century* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press 1943). 328–329.

¹⁹ Vásáry, István, "A török nyelv tanulmányozása a kora újkori európai egyetemeken" [The investigation of the ottoman language on the universities of the early modern period], *Gerundium* 11. (2020): 68–71.

²⁰ István Zichy's letters to Johann Rottal Magyar Nemzeti Levéltár Országos Levéltára [Hungarian National Archives National Archives] P 507 P 507-1.-A-438, és MNL OL P 707. fasc 84 NB Nr. 8500-8505.

²¹ After the death of palatine Ferenc Wesselényi (1667) temporally the Chamber managed the duties of the Jász-kun circle. But later in the same year the Chamber recommended Miklós Andrassy for jász-kun captaincy. comp.: Gyárfás, István, *A jász-kúnok története* [The History of the Jász-kuns,] Tomus 4, 1542–1686(Budapest, 1885.) 298–299.

²² István Zichy's letter to chancellor Ferenc Szegedy 04.05.1667. Pozsony. Egri Főegyházmegyei Levéltár (EFL) [Archdiocese Archives Eger] Arch. Secr. Num. 45. Letters to Ferenc Szegedy. Nr. 1., About Egyed Gencsy: Molnár, Szulpics, *A pannonhalmi főapátság története. Negyedik korszak* [The history of the Abbey of Pannonhalma. Fourth age], (h.n. 1906.)

²³ István Zichy's letter to László Esterházy 08.03.1652. Győr, MNL OL P 124. nr. 1375.;

²⁴ István Zichy's letter to Ádám Batthyány 28.11.1652. Megyer MNL OL P 1314 nr. 53143.;

as they are not famous people, only those who may have served well in the aristocratic courtyards of the area.

Although I do not find any other sign of patronage in István Zichy's correspondence, his best-known patronage is found in a thesis paper which was published in 1665. On the front page of Péter Potormani's thesis paper, – he was studying at the Jesuits in Kassa (Kosice) –, an engraving, shows the chamber president Zichy among the councilors of the Hungarian Chamber with several allegorical depictions.²⁵ The existence of the work was already pointed out in 1943,²⁶ but for its analysis, we had to wait until more recent years.²⁷ The draftsman of the thesis sheet is still unknown, but the master who made the copper engraving was Philipp Kilian.²⁸ Peter Potormani's patron choice was not coincidence. Potormani's supervisor and the initiator of the thesis was István Tarnóczy, a professor of the Jesuit Academy of Kosice. According to the recent research we know that the Tarnóczy moved to Győr in 1650 and worked in the Jesuit grammar school of the city.²⁹ As the vice-general of the frontier between 1646 and 1655 István Zichy was based in Győr, spending most of his time in the fortress city. Based on these, it cannot be ruled out that the then vice-general, later chamber president and Tarnóczy may have known each other well.³⁰

Unfortunately, to the best of our knowledge, we know only barely two dozen thesis papers published by Géza Galavics. Based on these, among the chosen patrons, the authors clearly preferred the current ruler Leopold I. However, there are quite a few of them which chose one of the influential Hungarian lords as their patron. On the other hand, we do not know any of those works on which István Zichy's predecessors were pictured on thesis papers. Nevertheless, it cannot be ruled out that the former chamber presidents of the 17th century were not among the supporters. This can also be assumed because, looking

²⁵ In the middle of the engraving sits István Zichy. Either side of him sits the councilors of the Chamber. They were at the time: Michael Partinger, Georg Horváth-Kissevith, Matthias Senkvicz and Mark Szentbenedeky.

²⁶ Zichy, "Adatok" 762.

²⁷ Galavics, Géza: "Magyar diákok 17. századi *tézislapjai Közép-Európában.*" [*The 17th century thesis boards of Hungarian students*], *Művészettörténeti értesítő* 53. no 1–4 (2004): 58–60; The analysis of the thesis board: Tüskés, Anna, Magyarországi klerikusok felsőfokú tanulmányai a 17. században [The higher education of the clerical people during the 17th century], in *Katolikus egyházi társadalom*, 121–139.

²⁸ Galavics, "Magyar diákok," 76.

²⁹ Kónya, Franciska, *Tarnóczy István és a kora újkori meditációs irodalom*, (István Tarnóczy and the early modern meditation literature (Kolozsvár/Cluj, Bolyai Társaság, 2015), 32.

³⁰ István Zichy in 1644 already had a house in Győr. In this year he had another house as pawn from the widow of Paul Révay. István Zichy's letter to the widow of Paul Révay 05.03.1644. Tata. MNL OL P 507 Nádaslady Archives of the Nádasdy family 1-A-388 Nr. 4.

at the list, in 1689 Michael Frank appointed Kristóf Erdődy, the current president of the Hungarian Chamber, as patron.³¹ It seems that for their later careers, both made a good decision. Potormani and Frank also became the officials of the chamber in Pozsony, although Frank was not without precedent.³² From this we can also see that it was purposely that the students chose the heads of the most important offices in the country as patrons. After all, they could count on the support of the presidents, and as we have seen, they could even be rewarded by a serious office. With the exception of Potormani and Frank, István Nagovith is also a good example. Although he was not educated specifically by Pál Pálffy, he was educated by Pálffy's parents in such a way that he was taken as a pupil with the Pálffy children. He probably already studied with the young Pálffy counts in Vienna. Later, during the Pálffy's higher education years, Nagovith's presence in Ingolstadt and then in Olomouc is showable.³³ Due to his lesser nobility origins, it is hardly plausible that his parents or himself, would have financed his expensive studies abroad. After that, he ran a classical career at the Hungarian Chamber, which he finished as an honorary councilor.³⁴

It is worth mentioning that during the confiscations after the Magnate conspiracy (1670-1671) many noble people turned to István Zichy for support. It is a well-known fact that although some of those who approached the Chamber President, such as István Barkóczy and his brother Ferenc Barkóczy, successfully avoided prosecution or received minor punishments, but it is questionable how much role did Zichy actually play in this. Deciding this will require further research. However, what is certain, the confidential letters to the chamber president repeatedly indicate that there was a patron-client relationship between the two parties, but they cannot be considered as a part of the patronage, because it was the rather the common style and form of letter writing of the age.³⁵

³¹ Galavics, "Magyar diákok," 77.

³² Fallenbüchl, Zoltán, "A Magyar Kamara tisztviselői a XVII. században" [The clerks of the Hungarian Chamber in the 17th century], *Levéltári Közlemények*, 39. no. (1968): 261–262.

³³ Bitskey, István, "A német nyelvterület jezsuita egyetemei és Magyarország a kora újkorban [The Jesuit universities of the German territories and Hungary in the early modern period], in *A magyar jezsuiták küldetése* 494.

³⁴ Fallenbüchl, Zoltán, *Allami (királyi és császári) tisztségviselők a 17. századi Magyarországon* [States (Royal and Imperial) Salariats in the 17th Century Hungary] (Budapest: Osiris, 2002) 208–209.

³⁵ Two examples for this: István Zichy's letter to István Fáy 03.08. 1671. Pozsony MNL OL P 1729. Zichy tries to free Ladislaus Fáy from his prison if his brother István Fáy send Zichy some gifts. Here, I want to say thank you to Mónika Horváth, PhD student of the Eszterházy Károly Catholic University, because she gave me this important document. Almost the same situation when Mihail Szentiványi, a customs official, called Zichy to his "fautor." Michael Szentiványi's letter to István Zichy 28.11.1670. Eperjes/Presov MNL OL P 507 The familial archive of the Nádasdy family. 1-A-443 Nr. 3.

Supporting churches, church institutions, and individuals especially artists

In addition to patronizing talented young people, it is worth mentioning the support and embrace of artists who are already active as an artist. Unfortunately, we do not know from the correspondence of István Zichy any famous artists, poets, painters etc. of the era, whom he supported at any stage of his life. Nevertheless, there are two authentic depictions of István Zichy from the period. The first one was recorded in 1649 by Elias Wiedemann or one of the assistants who accompanied the master.³⁶ Appearing in a series marked by the name of Elias Wiedemann, reveals that Zichy was already a significant person in 1649 as a vice general of the Győr border region, and he was also aware of the importance of patronizing art. In the other work, a hitherto unknown artist painted a portrait of the chamber president on canvas in the 1660s.³⁷ We do not have any other information from the 17th century that István Zichy carried out any art patronage. He was not alone with this. From his office predecessors, only Gáspár Lippay's, Mihály Majthényi's and Pál Pálffy's portraits are known also from the Wiedemann series.³⁸

As I mentioned above, Pálffy stood out significantly from this line. In his case, we know that he certainly supported artists, including architects, who rebuilt and redesigned his castles in Vöröskő and Detrekő in Baroque style.³⁹ This can be similarly assumed in the case of the Erdődy family, who served as presidents of the Hungarian Chamber – Christoph Erdődy (1684–1704) and Alexander Erdődy (1706–1718) – from the last third of the 17th century to the first half of 18th century.⁴⁰ It is true that proofs of this patronage are only known from the 18th century. We can be sure that István Zichy did not carry out constructions of a similar size even in the Divény estate which he acquired at the end of the century.⁴¹ In his correspondence, we cannot find any sign of employing artists or major craftsmen. Probably there were financial limits in the background. For the other presidents of the chamber, with the exception of the members of the two families mentioned, we can come to similar conclusions.

³⁶ Elias Wiedemann, *Icones Illustrium Heroum Hungariae*, (Wien 1652.) 100.

³⁷ The portrait of István Zichy István from the Castle Muzeum of Vöröskő. Unknown master's work from the 1660s. <http://www.npg.hu/component/jcollection/item/574> (accessed: 2021.12.04.)

³⁸ Wiedemann, *Icones Illustrium*, 49., 57., 67.,

³⁹ Fundarek, Anna, "Pálffy Pál építkezései" [The constructions of Pál Pálffy] *Sic itur ad astra* 13. no. 1 (2003): 15–34.

⁴⁰ Bubryák, Orsolya: Az ősök tisztelete az Erdődy grófok mecénási programjában [The ancestor-worship in the patronage program of the Erdődy counts], in *Idővel paloták...*, 549–581.

⁴¹ Szirácsik, Éva, *A divényi uradalom gazdálkodása a Zichy hitbizomány első száz évében (1687–1787)* [The economy of the Divény possession in the age of the first hundred years of the Zichy fidei-commissum], 19.

However, even if István Zichy built his mansion in Oroszvár (Rusovce, Slovakia), which served as his home, according to the artistic trends and style of the time, not much could be survived of it. In 1683, when Zichy served as a Crown Guard – he took the Holy Crown to the Emperor⁴² – he and his whole family escaped from the armies of Imre Thököly (1657–1705), and their mansion in Oroszvár was plundered by the soldiers of the “kuruc king.” This resulted in Zichy’s staying loyal to the emperor unlike the other aristocrats.⁴³ From the earlier research we know that István Zichy carried out constructions on several mansions and castles on his possession, such as in Darufalva (Draßburg, Austria) and in Jánosháza, but there are no signs of these constructions in his correspondence. Due to subsequent reconstructions during the 18th and 19th centuries there are only a few or no signs of these remained to these days.⁴⁴

Supporting institutions, such as the major schools of the age, had a key role for the nobility. This is well illustrated by the efforts of the Lutheran estates to establish and expand the College of Eperjes (Presov SK).⁴⁵ But the support of the Reformed School of Sepső⁴⁶ and later the Reformed College of Sárospatak played a similar role in the eyes of the Reformed estates.⁴⁷ The primary representation for the Catholic orders was the University of Nagyszombat (Trnava SK), – founded by Péter Pázmány – and the various Jesuit grammar schools in parallel.

Basically, the Zichy family’s relationship with the Catholic Church in the early 17th century was not necessarily the best. The most significant problem in this case was the controversy between the bishop of Veszprém and Paul Zichy (1570?–1638) – he was the father of István Zichy – over the bonded possessions of the bishopric.⁴⁸ However, after they resolved this hostility, the relationship visibly improved. At the time of his death Paul

⁴² Pálffy Géza: “A magyar korona először német földön (1683–1687)” [The first time of the Hungarian crown in Germany (1683-1687)] in. *A Szent Korona hazatér*; 325–339.

⁴³ Varga J., János, *Válaszúton. Thököly Imre és Magyarország 1682-1684.* (Budapest: MTA Történelemtudományi Intézet 2007.) 80. [Cross-roads.] Thököly Imre Zichy Istvánhoz, 12.07. 1683. Jánossy, OSZK [National Széchényi Library] fol lat. 2265. 96/189–190.

⁴⁴ Koppány, Tibor, *Kastélyok a végyárok mögött. Késő reneszánsz és kora barokk kastély építészet a 16–17. századi Dunántúlon* [Castles behind the fortresses], 151–152, 174–176, 216.

⁴⁵ Kónya, “Arisztokrácia és a nemesség,” 364–366.

⁴⁶ Szabadi, István, Adalékok Báthory István (1555–1605) mecénatúrájához. [Improvers to the patronage of István Báthory (1555-1605)] in. *Műveltség és társadalmi szerepek.* 297.

⁴⁷ Tamás, Edit, “Tűrelem és türelmetlenség a vallásgyakorlatban és az intézmények működésében Sárospatakon a 17–19. században” [Tolerance and intolerance], *Történeti Tanulmányok* 15. no. 1. (2007): 162–166.

⁴⁸ Jakab, Réka, “A veszprémi székeskáptalan a 17. században” [The Cathedral Chapter of Veszprém during the 17th century] in. *Erdőgyűjtés és újrakezdetés. A veszprémi egyházmegye története a 17. században.* 73–76.

Zichy was already mentioned as one of the greatest enemies of the reformed communities.⁴⁹

The contacts of chamber president Zichy with the University of Nagyszombat are little known. None of his sons studied there, but some of his grandsons visited the university at the end of the 17th century. Even so we do not know that he patronized the institution. Although it is not clear from his letters, he was probably one of the most important patrons of the grammar school of the Jesuits in Győr. The reason for this is that he and his family had a very close relationship with the town and the Jesuits whom serviced there. István Zichy completed his secondary education in Győr and was also a member of the local Congregation of Virgin Mary.⁵⁰ His sons and grandsons also became students at the grammar school in Győr.⁵¹

Beside the school in Győr, the church of the Jesuit had an important role which was build up through serious struggles and financed by the local and western Hungarian Catholic community. Unfortunately, we do not find István Zichy among the supporters. On the other hand, another chamber president, Gáspár Lippay (1646-1652) contributed significant amounts of money to the construction of the building. This was partly due to that fact that Lippay's older brother János Lippay (–1666), a Jesuit monk was the rector of the institute at the time.⁵² Apart from Gáspár Lippay, we know only in the case of Gáspár Horváth de Vegla (1560?-1624) that even before the founding of the University of Nagyszombat, he donated a garden to the school operating in the town.⁵³ Furthermore, Gáspár Horváth de Vegla played a major role in supporting the Jesuits both in the Kingdom of Hungary and in the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth. In 1604 he took the church of Tepla in Lower Hungary from the Lutheran community, decorated it richly and gave to the Jesuits.⁵⁴ In 1609 he founded a church near the town of Pren in the *starostwo*

⁴⁹ Gáspár Illésházy's notes about the death of Pál Zichy comp.: Szilágyi, Sándor, „Illésházy Gáspár feljegyzései” [Gaspar Illésházy's memoir], *Történelmi Társ.* 14. no. 4. (1891): 584.

⁵⁰ Acsay, Ferenc, *A győri kath. főgimnázium története. 1626–1900* [The history of the catholic gymnasium in Győr], (Győr, 1901), 153–156.

⁵¹ Kőkényesi Zsolt, “A győri jezsuita gimnázium diáksága a kezdetektől a feloszlásig (1630–1773), különös tekintettel a főnemesi tanulókra” [The students of the Jesuit gymnasium in Győr], in: *Jezsuita jelenlét Győrben a 17-18. században*, 162–163.; Károlyi, “Zichy II. Pál árváinak iskoláztatása,” 56–57.

⁵² Fazekas, István – Kádár, Zsófia, “A győri jezsuita templom 17. századi jötevei. a támogatók körének rekonstrukciója” [The benefactors of the Győr Jesuit Church in the 17th century], in: *Jezsuita jelenlét Győrben a 17-18. században*. 23.

⁵³ Károlyi, Bálint, “Egy rendhagyó karrier. Veglai Horváth Gáspár, a Magyar Kamara elnökének életútja” [An irregular carrier.], *Levéltári Közlemények* 90. no. 1 (2019): 154.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 132–133.

under his control.⁵⁵ Sad to say we do not know of any similar foundation or support from the other chamber presidents.

Libraries, books and patronage of book printing

If we turn to another form of patronage, like the support for publishing a book or possibly writing one's own book, we may get mixed results. In the case of the presidents, directors and senior councilors of the Hungarian and Spis (Szepesi) Chambers we know only two library catalogs. György Hoffmann (–1628)⁵⁶ and Zsigmond Holló (–1684)⁵⁷ were the director and senior councilor of the Spis Chamber during the 17th century. Although the Chamber in Pozsony was a major institution and the presidents played a more prominent role in the life of the country than those who were leading the Spis Chamber, we have almost no data about their libraries. In the case of lower-ranking officials' libraries, we have a little bit more information.⁵⁸ Sad to say the new research has not given us information about their libraries.⁵⁹ We do know a couple of book lists which show us the reading preferences of these people.⁶⁰

⁵⁵ Ibid.: 129. *Starostwo* is an administrative unit established in the fourteenth century in Poland.

⁵⁶ György Hoffman's book catalogue: *Magyarországi magánkönyvtárak I. 1533–1657* [Hungarian private libraries I. 1533–1657], (Adattár a XVI–XVII. századi szellemi mozgalmaink történetéhez 13.) Sajtó alá rend.: Varga András, (Budapest-Szeged, 1986), 124–126.

⁵⁷ Zsigmond Holló's book catalogue: Kassa város olvasmányai 1562–1731 [The readings of the city Kosice]. Sajtó alá rend.: Gácsai Hedvig – Farkas Gábor – Keveházi Katalin – Lázár István Dávid – Monok István – Németh Noémi, 71–72.

⁵⁸ Monok, István, *A művelt arisztokrata. A magyarországi főnemesség olvasmányai a XVI–XVII. században* (Budapest–Eger: Líceum–Kossuth Press 2012) [The cultured aristocrat.], 174–179.

⁵⁹ There are some novelties like the Library of the Czobor family. comp.: István Monok, *The Cultural Horizon of Aristocrats in the Hungarian Kingdom. Their Libraries and Erudition in the 16th and 17th Centuries* (Wien, 2019), 149–152.

⁶⁰ Some good examples: The catalogue of János Kecskés's library: *Magyarországi magánkönyvtárak I.* 124–126. 132–143.; For the formation of a library: Zvara, Edina, "Ismert könyvgyűjtők tulajdonosainak bejegyzései az Esterházy-könyvtárban." [Famous book collectors notifications] *Magyar Könyvszemle*, 127 no. 1. (2011): 1, 55–57, 61–63.; Information about Gáspár Tassy: Holl, Béla, "Tasi Gáspár. Adalékok XVII. századi fordítás-irodalmunk történetéhez" [Gaspar Tasi.], *Acta Universitatis Szegediensis: Acta Historiae Litterarum Hungaricarum*, Tomus 10–11, 1971. 99–106.; Károlyi, Bálint, "Tassy Gáspár ismertlen levele Melith Péterhez." [Gaspar Tassy's unknown letter], *Magyar Könyvszemle*, 137 no. 1. (2021): 80–85.

Unfortunately, I do not have any details about István Zichy's library.⁶¹ We can only assume that even if he had a collection of books, then he probably made a place for them in the mansions of his two beloved places of residence, in Oroszvár or Moson-szentmiklós. He does not mention any relevant information in his correspondence. Anyway, we have some notes about the reading preferences in István Zichy's family. The old lord constantly sent Italian language newspapers to his son István Zichy Jr., who served on the front during the Great Turkish War (1683-1699).⁶² It is certain that when István Zichy Jr. was accompanied by István Nádasdy during the young lords Grand Tour in western Europe,⁶³ he obtained a small number of books and atlases. At least this is evidenced by a letter of his brother Paul Zichy, who, perhaps for a separate library or a unified library for the family, rendered thanks to his brother for the atlases which he sent from The Hague.⁶⁴

There is a separate category for books which have been included in a library based on the dedication of the author. We know only the work of István Jaros,⁶⁵ published in Bratislava in 1671, the *Tabella Axiomatum*, which was dedicated to István Zichy and the councilors of the Hungarian Chamber, as well as some other officials.⁶⁶ Probably István Zichy had a copy of this work in his library. Beside this book we can conjecture that Zichy had another book at least for a short time, because István Vitnyédy, the famous lawyer and the secretary of the Croatian Ban, Miklós Zrínyi, advised Zichy to get from someone Hugo Grotius's *De Iure Belli Pacis* and read at least some part of it.⁶⁷

As we have seen, from the correspondence of István Zichy, the surviving letters tell us almost nothing about their writer's literacy, nor about the supporting of book printing. The most interesting pieces of his correspondence were written in the middle of the 1650s. Ádám Batthyány, one of the greatest aristocrats in the western Hungarian region,

⁶¹ I found a small book collection of the Zichy family, but these books not belonged to the main branch of the family. MNL SML Kötetek Nr. 1–15.

⁶² István Zichy's letter to his youngest son Adam Zichy 30.04. 1692. Trnava/Nagyszombat, MNL OL Zichy family archives P 707 fasc 84 NB Nr. 14235.

⁶³ Toma, Katalin, Nádasdy István európai tanulmány útja [István Nádasdy's European Grand Tour] in: *Idővel paloták...* 192–214.

⁶⁴ Pál Zichy's letter to István Zichy Jr. 07.05.1670. In.: Károlyi, Bálint. "Adalékok Nádasdy István nyugat-európai utazásához Levelek ifjabb Zichy István levelestárcájából" *Lymbus*, 2, no. 1 (2021): 521–522.

⁶⁵ István Jaros was the student of the Jesuit gymnasium in Pozsony. He wrote his two works during his rhetoric studies comp.: Szinnyi, József, *Magyar írók élete és munkái* [The life and works of hungarian writers], vol. 5. (Budapest, 1897), 418.

⁶⁶ RMK II. 1285.

⁶⁷ István Vitnyédy's letter to István Zichy [The letters of István Vitnyédy] April 18, 1662. Sopron published in: Fabó András: *Vitnyédy István levelei 1652–1662*, 199–200.

after the death of his first wife, wanted to remarry. Because of this, he travelled to Graz several times to find a wife for himself. Due to this, István Zichy shared his opinions about the good relationship with Batthyány. In his first letter Zichy wrote just how to play games together as a couple and that it would be a good idea if the Batthyánys teach the chosen lady to learn Turkish. István Zichy believed that the importance of this is in the familiarity, because ordinary people in the court do not understand Turkish, but they could easily communicate with each other.⁶⁸ It is interesting because if we read Antonio Guevara's book, the *Horologii Principum*, carefully, we find examples of both statements. Almost at the beginning of his book, master Guevara stated that marriage between a man and a woman is the best company, even a friendship.⁶⁹ Reading Zichy's letter, the mention of common play grabs attention. According to the book it was a natural thing for a man and a woman to play together. A good example for this László Rákóczi (–1664), the catholic nephew of the Transylvanian prince György Rákóczi I, who mentions several times in his diary that he played with his wife.⁷⁰

In the first chapter of Guevara's book, among the criteria of a good wife, we find reliability and the fact that a couple must be always faithful to each other. According to the Spanish author, it is the wife's duty to stand by her husband when his enemies multiply and his situation turns so bad that he cannot trust anyone.⁷¹ It is important that Antonio Guevara's book has become readable in Hungarian since 1610, thanks to János Draskovits (1550-1613) who translated it from Latin. The work was fairly popular in the period, and even after in the 18th century.⁷² Presumably István Zichy read it, or perhaps he had Guevara's book or the Hungarian translation in his own (?) library.⁷³

If we consider the work dedicated to the chamber presidents before István Zichy, we can see that Zichy's case is not unique. Sad to say our task is a not easy, because there have been no works found that are dedicated to Tamás Vizkelethy, Gáspár Horváth de Vegla, György Rakoviczky and Mihály Majthényi. On the other hand, in 1616, Márton Kopcsányi recommended his work *Gospels and Epistels* to László Pethe and other officials

⁶⁸ István Zichy's letter to Adam Batthyány 02.03.1654. Győr, MNL OL P 1314 Nr. 53162.

⁶⁹ Guevara, Antonio: *Horologii principum, Az Fejedelmek órájának második könyve fordította Draskovits János, Graz, 1610*, published by Komlowszky Tibor, Budapest, 1989, 1.

⁷⁰ Várkonyi, Gábor, Ünnepek és hétköznapiok Művelődés és mentalitás a török kori Magyarországon [Holidays and weekdays], 195.

⁷¹ Guevara, "Az Fejedelmek órája," 9.

⁷² Ibid. 25.

⁷³ Later an accurate philological analysis on the correspondence of István Zichy will help us to get more information about his readings.

of the chamber.⁷⁴ Much better known is Péter Pázmány's work the „*Kereszteni imádságos keönyv*”, published in Graz in 1606, which was recommended to Anna Kapy, the second wife of László Pethe.⁷⁵

Thirty years later, only a Krakow calendar, printed in Vienna in 1648, was recommended to Gáspár Lippay. The Viennese printer Gergely Gelbhaar recommended the complete work not only for the chamber president, but also to his eldest brother, György Lippay (1600-1666) the archbishop of Esztergom.⁷⁶ It is worth noting that we do not know any dedication to Pál Pálffy from the time of his chamber presidency, but from later years when he became the palatine of Hungary there were a few books and printings which were dedicated to him.

The patronage of the Habsburg Monarchy's chamber presidents (outlook)

If we take a brief outlook, beyond the borders of the Kingdom of Hungary to the patronage of the chamber leaders of the Austrian and Czech territories, we will see significant differences. Fortunately, owing to new research and publications, we are already familiar with the lists of the leaders of all chambers operating in the Habsburg Monarchy.⁷⁷ Unfortunately we have only a few biographical works about them, which do not deal with their patronage.⁷⁸ In this article we have no place to do new research in this field, but we can light on a few facts that act on the differences of the patronage of the chamber presidents of the Hungarian and Habsburg Monarchy.

The first and most important thing that can be stated from the completed archontological list is that, unlike the Kingdom of Hungary, the third and second line of the aristocracy do not dominate, but the peak of the aristocracy of the region is represented. There is no significant separation here like in Hungary where in the 16th century it was dominated by the ecclesiastical elite, in fact there were relatively few ecclesiastical leaders in this office. Because of this these aristocrats, with their serious economic and material

⁷⁴ RMK I. 481.

⁷⁵ RMK I. 403.

⁷⁶ RMK I. 801.

⁷⁷ Michael Hochedlinger, Petr Mat' a und Thomas Winkelbauer (Hg.), *Verwaltungsgeschichte der Habsburgermonarchie in der Frühen Neuzeit, Band 1/1 und 1/2*, 833, 846, 854, 880, 901.

⁷⁸ Brigitte Holl, „Hofkammerpräsident Gundaker Thomas Graf Starhemberg und die österreichische Finanzpolitik der Barockzeit (1703–1715).”, Hansdieter Körbl, *Die Hofkammer und ihr ungetreuer Präsident.*; Thea Lindquist, “Clement von Radolt (1593–1670) A Multifarious Career in the seventeenth-century Imperial Service.” *Mitteilungen des Österreichischen Staatsarchivs* 52, 2007, 9–29. Some short biographies of the chamber presidents: Henry Frederick Schwarz, *The Imperial Privy Council in the Seventeenth Century*, *passim*.

background in relation to the Habsburg Monarchy, may have pursued more significant patronage.⁷⁹ But there are some good works which are focusing on patronage, even if they were written in another context.⁸⁰

In addition to the material and social background, the geographical features also significantly widen the gap between the two parts of the Habsburg Monarchy. First of all, the Kingdom of Hungary became a relatively peripheral region during this period, although the center of the Monarchy was close, in Vienna. But it was a completely different world. Vienna, as the center of the Monarchy temporarily, Prague under the rule of Rudolf II, meant that significant crowds were concentrated here, as the court offered them a good opportunity. The aristocrats, including the presidents of the chambers who were at home in these cities, had a better chance of employing artists and other creators and competing with each other. The reason for this was that the chamber presidents built huge palaces in Vienna, many of which can still be seen today.⁸¹ Let us refer to the buildings of the Liechtenstein, Kolowrat, Lobkowitz or Sinzendorf families. In constructing them, the most significant masters available to them were employed to represent themselves before the court and the emperor. On the other hand, in only two and a half cases can we be sure when the presidents of the Hungarian Chamber had some real estate in the capital. Pál Pálffy and his family already had good relations in Vienna in the 16th century,⁸² while at the turn of the 16-17th centuries László Pethe probably had a house in the imperial city. In the case of István Zichy we know from a letter that he had a small house in the city, but it is the least suitable for representation, as it burned down in 1654.⁸³

It seems like a huge difference. But if we think about the members of the Hungarian aristocracy who generally were away from Vienna, and only a few of them had their own estates in the city, it is normal. The outcome of this was that most of the aristocrats were out of opportunities to get in contact with the artists and other creators.⁸⁴

⁷⁹ James Van Horn Melton, “The Nobility in the Bohemian and Austrian Lands, 1620–1780.” in *The European Nobilities of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*, Volume II, 110–143.

⁸⁰ Gundaker von Liechtenstein was the Court Chamber president between 1620 and 1622. He and his family became one of the greatest patrons of the Habsburg Monarchy. Gustav Wilhelm, “Die Fürsten von Liechtenstein und ihre Beziehungen zu Kunst und Wissenschaft,” in: *Liechtensteinische Kunstgesellschaft*, (Vaduz 1977), 9–181.

⁸¹ About building palaces in Vienna: Wolfgang Pircher, “*Verwüstung und Verschwendung. Adeliges Bauen nach der Zweiten Türkenbelagerung.*”

⁸² Pálffy, Géza, A Pálffy család felemelkedése a 16. században. [The rising of the Pálffy family] in: *Pálffyok a novoveku* ed.: Anna Fundarkova – Géza, Pálffy (Bratislava – Budapest, 2003), 17–36.

⁸³ István Zichy’s letter to Ádám Batthyány 10.07.1654. Győr, MNL OL P 1314 Missiles, Nr. 53168.

⁸⁴ Pálffy, Géza, “A magyar nemesség I. Ferdinánd bécsi udvarában.” [The Hungarian nobility in Ferdinand Habsburg’s court] *Történelmi Szemle* 45. no 1–2. (2003): 45–59.

Conclusion

As we can see, István Zichy and the presidents of the Hungarian Chamber were not hiding patrons at all. Given their talent and even more so their financial means, they sought to stand out as patrons like their wealthier contemporaries. Based on the little information we know, we can safely say that both Zichy and his office predecessors and successors were active patrons. We can only consider them „hiding” because they have not been at the forefront of the research. I believe that this may be due to the small number of, or lack of, resources. But as we see we could use other sources than are generally used for analyzing the patronage.

From my work it is clear that the second and third line of the aristocracy also had patronage, but there were some differences. The first thing is that their opportunities were much more limited, because their fortune was not as significant as the high aristocracy's. The second thing is that their most important duty was the integration in the aristocracy which needed the most of their money and, significantly, their attention. Beside these duties the patronage was secondary.

As a result of my work, we can see that this field offers more opportunities for the future. One is to expand the direction of research. After a more thorough understanding of the patronage of the chamber presidents, we would have the opportunity to compare the activities of second and third-line aristocratic families, not just in the Kingdom of Hungary but in the Habsburg Monarchy. Through such work, we could get an even more complete picture of the patronage activities of the official elite of Hungary and the Habsburg Monarchy.

Finally, as we saw, the best opportunity may be to compare the patronage activities of the chamber presidents of the Habsburg Monarchy. That work will not be easy due to the social, financial and even geographical differences. But after we have enough knowledge about the nobility of the Habsburg Monarchy, we will be able to understand better the place of the chamber presidents on the stage of the patronage.

Archival sources:

Hungarian National Archives National Archives (MNL OL) Magyar Nemzeti Levéltár Országos Levéltára

P 124 Documents of Ladislaus Esterházy

P 507 Family Archive of the Nádasdy family from Nádasladány

P 707. Family Archive of the Zichy family

P 1314 Family Archive of the Batthyány family (missiles)

P 1729 Family Archive of the Fáy family

SML Archives of Somogy county

Archdiocese Archives (EFL) Eger Egri Főegyházmegyei Levéltár Archivum. Secretum. Numero 45.

References:

Acsády, Ignác. *“Magyarország pénzügyei I. Ferdinánd uralkodása alatt 1526–1564.”* Budapest: MTA Press, 1888.

Acsay, Ferenc. *A győri kath. főgimnázium története. 1626–1900.* Győr, 1901.

Bartók, István. “A Nádasdy-mecenatúra hatása az irodalmi gondolkodásra,” in *Nádasdy Tamás (1498–1562). Tudományos emlékülés*, ed. Söptei, István, Sárvár: Nádasdy Ferenc Múzeum, 1999, 117–130.

Bartók, István. “KARRIER és mecenatúra. Nádasdy Tamás és sárvári udvartartása.” in *Arisztokrácia, művészetek, mecenatúra*. ed. Czoma, László, Keszthely: Helikon Press, 2000, 33–43.

Bitskey, István. „A német nyelvterület jezsuita egyetemei és Magyarország a kora újkorban.” in *A magyar jezsuiták küldetése a kezdetektől napjainkig*. ed. Szilágyi Csaba. Piliscsaba: Pázmány Péter University Press, 2008, 481–496.

Bobory, Dóra. “Batthyány Boldizsár és humanista köre: Erudíció, természettudomány és mecenatúra egy 16. századi magyar főúr életében,” *Századok*, 139 no. 4. (2005): 923–944.

Borbély, Zoltán. “A nemesi társadalom struktúrája és a hétköznapi élet keretei Felső-Magyarországon a 17. század első felében.” in *Oszmán-magyar viszony a 16-18. században: Tanulmányok a Magyar Királyság és az Oszmán Birodalom népeinek – magyarok, törökök, rácok, tatárok, zsidók görögök és egyéb népek – hétköznapijairól; egyén és közösség viszonya*. ed. J. Újváry, Zsuzsanna, Budapest, Szent István Társulat, 2020, 191–212.

Bubryák, Orsolya. “*Az ősök tisztelete az Erdődy grófok mecénási programjában.*” in *Idővel paloták... Magyar udvari kultúra a 16-17. században...* ed.: G. Etényi, Nóra – Horn, Ildikó, Budapest: Balassi Press, 2005, 549–581.

Buzási, Enikő. “Gondolatok Nádasdy Ferenc mecenatúrájához, avagy mikor készült az árpási főoltárkép?” in *Idővel paloták... Magyar udvari kultúra a 16-17. században*. ed. G.

Etényi, Nóra – Horn, Ildikó, Budapest, Balassi Press 2005, 582–624.

Elias Wiedemann, *Icones Illustrium Heroum Hungariae*, Wien 1652.

Esterházy Pál a műkedvelő mecénás. ed. Ács, Pál, Budapest, 2015.

Fabó András. *Vitnyédy István levelei 1652–1662. Adalékkül a XVII. századi politikai és erkölcs-történetéhez I.* Budapest, 1871.

Fallenbüchl, Zoltán. “A Magyar Kamara tisztviselői a XVII. században.” *Levéltári Közlemények*, 39. no. (1968): 233–268.

Fallenbüchl, Zoltán, *Állami (királyi és császári) tisztségviselők a 17. századi Magyarországon.* Budapest: Osiris, 2002.

Fazekas, István – Kádár, Zsófia. “A győri jezsuita templom 17. századi jótevői. a támogatók körének rekonstrukciója.” in. *Jezsuita jelenlét Győrben a 17-18. században: Tanulmányok a 375 éves Szent Ignác-templom történetéhez.* ed. Fazekas, István – Kádár, Zsófia – Kökényesi, Zsolt. (Győr: Szent Mór bencés perjelség, 2017, 13–59

Fundarek, Anna. “Pálffy Pál építkezései” *Sic itur ad astra* 13. no. 1 (2003): 15–34.

Galavics, Géza. “A mecénás Esterházy Pál.” (Vázlat egy pályaképhez), *Művészettörténeti értesítő*, 37. no. 3-4. (1988): 136–161.;

Galavics, Géza. “Magyar diákok 17. századi *tézislapjai Közép-Európában,*” *Művészettörténeti értesítő* 53. no 1-4 (2004): 53–80.

Guevara, Antonio. “*Horologii principium, Az Fejedelmek órájának második könyve fordította Draskovits János,*” *Graz, 1610.* Közre adta Komlowszky Tibor, Budapest, 1989.

Gyárfás, István. “*A jász-kánok története.* Tomus 4., 1542-1686.” Budapest, 1885, 298–299.

Holl, Béla. “Tasi Gáspár. Adalékok XVII. századi fordítás-irodalmunk történetéhez”, *Acta Universitas Szegediensis: Acta Historiae Litterarum Hungaricarum*, Tomus 10–11, 1971.

Brigitte Holl. Hofkammerpräsident Gundaker Thomas Graf Starhemberg und die österreichische Finanzpolitik der Barockzeit (1703-1715). Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1976.

Jakab, Réka. “*A veszprémi székeskáptalan a 17. században,*” in *Erőgyűjtés és újrakezdés. A veszprémi egyházmegye története a 17. században.* ed, Karlinszky, Balázs – Varga, Tibor László. Veszprém: OOK-Press, 2019, 71–90.

Károlyi, Bálint. “Zichy II. Pál árváinak iskoláztatása. Iskoláztatási stratégia a Zichy családban a 17. század második felébe,” *Aetas*, 34. no. 2. (2019): 53–64.

Károlyi, Bálint. “Egy rendhagyó karrier. Veglai Horváth Gáspár, a Magyar Kamara elnökének életútja,” *Levéltári Közlemények* 90. no. 1 (2019): 119–158.

Károlyi, Bálint, “Tassy Gáspár ismertlen levele Melith Péterhez,” *Magyar Könyvszemle*, 137 no. 1. (2021): 80–85.

Károlyi, Bálint. “Adalékok Nádasdy István nyugat-európai utazásához Levelek ifjabb Zichy István levelestárcájából” *Lymbus*, 2021. 2/1 507–525.

Kassa város olvasmányai 1562–1731. Sajtó alá rend.: Gácsi Hedvig – Farkas Gábor – Keveházi Katalin – Lázár István Dávid – Monok István – Németh Noémi, (Adattár a XVI-XVII. századi szellemi mozgalmaink történetéhez 15.) Szeged: 1990.

Kökényesi, Zsolt. “A győri jezsuita gimnázium diáksága a kezdetektől a feloszlásig (1630–1773), különös tekintettel a főnemesi tanulókra,” in *Jezsuita jelenlét Győrben a 17–18. században: Tanulmányok a 375 éves Szent Ignác-templom történetéhez*. ed. Fazekas, István – Kádár, Zsófia – Kökényesi, Zsolt. Győr: Szent Mór bencés perjelség, 2017, 133–167.

Koltai, András. *Batthány Ádám és könyvtára*. Szeged, 2002.

Koltai, András. “A Batthyányak udvari zenészei (1627–1664) Adattár.”, in *A Batthyányak évszázadai: Tudományos konferencia Körmenden. 2005. október 27–29.* ed. Nagy, Zoltán, Körmend: Körmend City Press, 2006, 231–244.;

Koltai, András. “A Batthyányiak és Carlo della Torre szerződése a rohonci templom építésére.” *Művészettörténeti értesítő*. 57 (2008): 387–393.

Komlowszky, Tibor. *Horologii principium, azaz az fejedelmek órájának második könyve*, Budapest, 1989.

Kónya, Franciska. *Tarnóczy István és a kora újkori meditációs irodalom*. Kolozsvár/Cluj, Bolyai Társaság, 2015.

Kónya, Péter. “Az arisztokrácia és a nemesség szerepe az eperjesi kollégium alapításában” in *Műveltség és társadalmi szerepek: arisztokraták Magyarországon és Európában*. ed. Bárány, Attila – Orosz, István – Papp, Klára – Vinkler, Bálint Debrecen, Kapitális Press, 2014, 361–372.

Koppány, Tibor. *Kastélyok a végvárak mögött. Késő reneszánsz és kora barokk kastély építészet a 16–17. századi Dunántúlon*, Budapest: Balassi Press 2014.

Hansdieter Körbl. “*Die Hofkammer und ihr ugatreuer Präsident. Eine Finanzbehörde zur Zeit Leopolds I.*” Oldenburg: Böhlau, 2009.

Thea Lindquist. “Clement von Radolt (1593–1670) A Multifarious Career in the seventeenth-century Imperial Service,” *Mitteilungen des Österreichischen Staatsarchivs* 52. 2007, 9–29.

Magyarországi magánkönyvtárak I. 1533–1657. (Adattár a XVI–XVII. századi szellemi mozgalmaink történetéhez 13.) Sajtó alá rend.: Varga András, Budapest-Szeged, 1986.

James Van Horn Melton, “The Nobility in the Bohemian and Austrian Lands, 1620–1780.” In. *The European Nobilities of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries, Volume II: Northern, Central and Eastern Europe* ed. H.M. Scott. London–New York: Longman, 1995.

Molnár, Szulpics. “*A pannonhalmi főapátság története. Negyedik korszak: Nagybáborúk kora, a magyar Szent-Benedek-rend fölözslása és föléledése, 1535–1708.* (h.n. 1906.)

Monok, István. “*A művelt arisztokrata. A magyarországi főnemesség olvasmányai a XVI–XVII. században.*” (Budapest–Eger: Líceum–Kossuth Press 2012 [The cultured aristocrat. The readings of the hungarian aristocracy in the 16–17th century], 174–179.

Monok, István, “*A Rákóczi-család könyvtárai 1588–1660.*” Budapest, Scriptum kft., 1996.

István, Monok. “*The Cultural Horizon of Aristocrats in the Hungarian Kingdom. Their Libraries and Erudition in the 16th and 17th Centuries.*” (Wien, 2019), 149–152.

Pálffy, Géza. “*A magyar korona először német földön (1683-1687)*,” in. *A Szent Korona hazatér. A magyar korona tizenegy külföldi útja (1205-1978)* ed.: Pálffy, Géza, Budapest MTA Történelemtudományi Intézet, 2019, 321–364.

Pálffy, Géza. “A Pálffy család felemelkedése a 16. században.” In. *Pálfovci v novoveku: Vzostup významného uhorského šlechtického rodu: Zborník z vedeckej konferencie Bratislava 20. mája 2003.* Ed.: Anna Fundarkova – Géza, Pálffy, Bratislava – Budapest, 2003, 17–36.

Pálffy, Géza. “A magyar nemesség I. Ferdinánd bécsi udvarában.” *Történelmi Szemle* 45. no 1–2. (2003): 45–59.

Wolfgang Pircher, “*Verwüstung und Verschwendung. Adeliges Bauen nach der Zweiten Türkenbelagerung.*” Wien: Forschungen und Beiträge zur Wiener Stadtgeschichte 14, 1984.

Johannes Baptista Podesta, *Dissertatio academica, continens specimen triennalis profectus in linguis orientalibus etc.* Viennae, Austriae, 1677.

Martyn Rady, “*The Customary Law of the Renowned Kingdom of Hungary: A Work in Three Parts (the „Tripartitum”) Stephen Werbőczy (Laws of East Central Europe).*” Budapest: Central European University Press, 2005.

Sárközi, Gergely. “Vitnyédy István és az evangélikus oktatásügy.” *Credo*, 12, no 1–2. (2006): 3–16.

Henry Frederick Schwarz. “*The Imperial Privy Council in the Seventeenth Century,*” *Harvard Historical Studies*, 53. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1943.

Szabadi, István. “*Adalékok Báthory István (1555–1605) mecénatúrájához,*” in. *Műveltség és társadalmi szerepek: arisztokraták Magyarországon és Európában.* ed. Bárány, Attila – Orosz, István – Papp, Klára – Vinkler, Bálint. Debrecen, Kapitális Press, 2014, 293–299.

Szabó, András. “Mágócsy Gáspár és András udvara,” in.: *Magyar reneszánsz udvari kultúra.* ed. R. Várkonyi Ágnes, Budapest, 1987, 263–280.

Szabó, Péter. “A Thököly család és a görög-római kultúra. A késmárki várkastély egyik falfestményének tanulságai,” *Credo*, 11 no 3-4. (2005): 203–210.

Szilágyi, Sándor. “Illésházy Gáspár feljegyzései,” *Történelmi Tár*, 14. no. 4 (1891): 559–588.

Szinnyei, József. *Magyar írók élete és munkái*, 5. köt. Budapest, 1897, 418.

Szirácsik, Éva. “*A divényi uradalom gazdálkodása a Zichy hitbizomány első száz évében (1687–1787),*” Salgótarján: Archives of the county Nógrád, 2005, 19.

Tamás, Edit. “Türelem és türelmetlenség a vallásgyakorlatban és az intézmények működésében Sárospatakon a 17–19. században,” *Történelmi Tanulmányok* 15. no. 1. (2007): 161–178.

Toma, Katalin. “Nádasdy István európai tanulmány útja.” in. *Idővel paloták... Magyar udvari kultúra a 16-17. században.* ed. G. Etényi, Nóra–Horn, Ildikó, Budapest: Balassi Press 2005, 192–214.

Tüskés, Anna. "Magyarországi klerikusok felsőfokú tanulmányai a 17. században. Potmani Péter tézislapja a kassai akadémián," in: *Katolikus egyházi társadalom a Magyar Királyságban a 17. században*. ed. Varga, Szabolcs – Vértesi, Lázár, Pécs: META-Egyesület, 2018. 121–139.

Vásáry, István, "A török nyelv tanulmányozása a kora újkori európai egyetemeken," *Gerundium* 11. (2020): 61–77.

Varga J., János. "*Válaszúton. Thököly Imre és Magyarország 1682-1684*," Budapest: MTA Történelemtudományi Intézet 2007.

Várkonyi, Gábor. "Ünnepek és hétköznapok Művelődés és mentalitás a török kori Magyarországon," Budapest, 2009.

Viskolcz, Noémi, *A mecenatúra színterei a főúri udvarban. Nádasdy Ferenc könyvtára, Szeged–Budapest: Historia Ecclesiastica Hungarica Alapítvány, 2013.*

Verwaltungsgeschichte der Habsburgermonarchie in der Frühen Neuzeit, Band 1/1 und 1/2: Hof und Dynastie, Kaiser und Reich, Zentralverwaltungen, Kriegswesen und landesfürstliches Finanzwesen ed. Michael Hochedlinger, Petr Mat' a und Thomas Winkelbauer Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung, Ergbd. 62, Wien 2019.

Gustav Wilhelm. "Die Fürsten von Liechtenstein und ihre Beziehungen zu Kunst und Wissenschaft," in *Liechtensteinische Kunstgesellschaft, Vaduz 1977*, 9–181.

Zvara, Edina. "Ismert könyvgyűjtők tulajdonosainak bejegyzései az Esterházy-könyvtárba," *Magyar Könyvszemle*, 127 no. 1. (2011): 1, 47–71.

Zichy, István. „Adatok egy XVII. századi katolikus főúri család történetéhez. Öregebbik Zichy István gróf (1616–1693.)” *Regnum egyháztörténeti évkönyv tomus 5.*, Budapest, 1942–1943. 734–764.

BARNA SZAMOSI

**Shifting Concerns of Public Health in Post-Second World War Hungary:
From Contagious Diseases to Congenital Disorders**

Pro&Contra 5

No. 2 (2021) 31–55

<https://doi.org/10.33033/pc.2021.2.31>

Abstract

In the 1950s the most important epidemiological problem was the threat that contagious diseases represented for the population therefore the aim of healthcare professionals was to significantly reduce the morbidity and mortality rates resulting from these diseases. With the introduction of vaccinations, these previously lethal diseases ceased to represent any serious public health issue for the majority of Hungarians and this was visible in the statistical data. As the genetic turn reached Hungary in the 1960s clinicians recognized that new methods of genetics can be used to understand the causes of mortality and morbidity rates resulting from reproduction. Because accompanying the success of curbing contagious diseases health statistics have shown an increase in congenital disorders and thus the focus shifted towards finding ways to develop these healthcare results. Thus, reproduction became a central concern in the 1960s and 1970s for clinicians. This paper will map out the shift that took place during this period to show that eugenic thinking was present in these public health discussions, and were – to some extent – uncritically integrated into the medical genetic discussions regarding reproduction¹.

Keywords: public health, medical genetics, reproduction, eugenics

Eugenic Concerns After the 1950s

It is debated in the literature whether eugenics is still a relevant discourse shaping medical decision making since the 1950s². Scholars, such as Nikolas Rose for example, argue that the contemporary medical practice is radically different from the eugenic discourses of the past. He claims that ‘optimization’ is the key concern in this medical paradigm³. He suggests that the contemporary focus on susceptibility is an extension of two modes of thought: (1) predisposition and (2) risk. Both have a long history dating back to the 18th and 19th centuries as Michel Foucault had explored⁴. Predisposition was understood as an inherited flaw that would manifest itself in illness or pathology. In the 19th century

¹ I developed this article from my PhD research that was supported by the Central European University. Here I would like to express my gratitude towards my supervisors Andrea Pető and Judit Sándor who tirelessly helped the articulation of my ideas during my work. I am indebted to Colin Swatridge for proofreading and discussing my drafts. And I also thank to two anonymous peer reviewers who gave very valuable feedback before the publication of this paper.

² Bashford, “Epilogue: Where Did Eugenics Go?”

³ Rose, *The Politics of Life Itself*.

⁴ Foucault, *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the College de France, 1978-79*; Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archeology of Medical Perception*.

all predispositions (social pathology and danger) were understood as degeneracy. It encompassed problems like: urban existence affecting the life quality of the working class and other city dwellers, for others it was about how migrants contribute negatively to the nation's health standards, or how pathologies (such as tuberculosis, venereal diseases, mental illnesses) affect the quality of the offspring. Others said that the issue is rather about how these 'degenerates' are kept alive by the welfare state, so that they can pass down to their offspring their deteriorated genetic structure, thus contributing to a downward spiral of general health standards. The concerns of the biotechnological discourse over susceptibility are thus connected to these older beliefs. But according to Rose there is an important transformation in this new perspective in contrast to the earlier concerns. This, accompanied by the results of epidemiological studies that explore various sectors of the population (divided by age, gender, race, class, weight, diet, family history etc.), suggest risk scales to assess an individual's susceptibility to develop a certain disease. This means that the present discourse looks at individuals as pre-symptomatically ill. And the direction of biotechnological work is in that of the optimization of the life chances of the individual. This makes it radically different from eugenic discourses. Other social critics such as Allen Buchanan⁵, Dan W. Brock⁶, or John Harris,⁷ similarly to Rose, see much more the positive contribution of genetic research to our societies and they think it should not be conflated with the eugenics of the past.

Other scholars also acknowledge the radical change that occurred in the perception of eugenics after the Second World War. The pseudo-scientific practices of the Nazi geneticists caused a major turning point in the health policy and genetic research of the US⁸ for example. The focus shifted towards genetic screening and counseling to control the reproductive decisions of the citizens. During this period, we can see that the molecular level starts to dominate the medical discourse. The critical analysis of the eugenic movements in the United States and in Western Europe started to take place much earlier than the analyses of these movements within the Eastern part of Europe. For example, Daniel J. Kevles, an American historian, provided rich analyses on the history of eugenics and gave insights into the eugenic policies of the United States that lasted well beyond the

⁵ Buchanan, *Beyond Humanity? The Ethics of Biomedical Enhancement*.

⁶ Brock, *Life and Death: Philosophical Essays in Biomedical Ethics*.

⁷ Harris, *Enhancing Evolution: The Ethical Case for Making People Better*.

⁸ Larsen, "Biology and the Emergence of Anglo-American Eugenics Movement."

Second World War⁹. In Europe as well, eugenic policies were at work after the 1950s¹⁰. This paper will contribute to this strand of research, as it will map out the shift that took place during the post Second World War period to show that eugenic thinking was present in these public health discussions, and were – to some extent – uncritically integrated into the Hungarian medical genetic discussions regarding reproduction.

Developing Public Health Institutions After the Second World War

There were two fields that Hungarian medical professionals emphasized as central for the elevation of health standards early in the 1950s: (1) mother and infant protection, and (2) institutional foundations of public health. Although Hungary had excellent, internationally acknowledged medical researchers and clinicians the country's general health statistics were among the last in Europe taking into account the country's data regarding tuberculosis death rates, infant mortality rates, or typhoid fever. István Simonovits¹¹ claimed that this situation fundamentally changed after the Second World War. He listed changes in various fields such as general healing and preventive medicine, where the system of general practitioners was changed in order to function better. The GP system radically changed between the years of 1950 and 1954 because they centralized the city, city district, village, and panel-doctor system. These changes made medical services much more accessible to everyone¹². It is important to note that Simonovits said that the preventive approach, inherited from the interwar period, was compatible with the socialist values therefore the centralization of public healthcare were executed with the aim of making healthcare accessible to everyone. The difference in the socialist approach to prevention in comparison to the capitalist approach, according to Simonovits, was that it included environmental issues as well such as the workers' working and living conditions. The socialist preventive method entailed work that encompassed public health and epidemiology, mother and child protection, but in addition to these issues it sought to develop the working and living conditions of the working class. The reason for this lies in the ac-

⁹ Kevles, *In the Name of Eugenics: Genetics and the Uses of Human Heredity*; Kevles, "Controlling the Genetic Arsenal"; Kevles, "Eugenics and Human Rights"; Kevles, "Genetics in the United States and Great Britain, 1890-1930: A Review with Speculations."

¹⁰ Weindling, *Health, Race, and German Politics between National Unification and Nazism, 1870-1945*; Roll-Hansen, "Conclusion: Scandinavian Eugenics in the International Context"; Tydén, "The Scandinavian States: Reformed Eugenics Applied."

¹¹ Simonovits, István (1907-1985), physician, hematologist, university professor, undersecretary, and a member of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences.

¹² Simonovits, "A Gyógyító-Megelőző Ellátás Fejlődésének Tíz Éve," 88-89.

knowledge that without improving these factors long lasting change in public health standards would not happen¹³.

Simonovits recalled that the first sign of state intention to centralize healthcare occurred in the nineteenth century. The 1876. XIV. statute first paragraph stated that “public health belongs to the sphere of state governmentality”¹⁴. So he said that although it is true that efforts to centralize healthcare started more than eighty years ago it was not completed for various reasons (the capitalist approach of the Dualist period, still different approach in the interwar period, the Second World War) but in the fifties stronger efforts were made to complete the process. For example epidemiological work strongly improved because, as Simonovits wrote, until the end of the Second World War there was only one institution that dealt with public health¹⁵. After the war the National Institution of Workhealth (OMI) was organized, but at the same time the National Food Safety Institute was also established (OÉTTI). In relation to epidemiology the most important development was the organization of KÖJÁL¹⁶ across the country in 1954. This meant that a network of epidemiological stations was established in every county of the country (basically these stations were situated in county towns)¹⁷. These institutes were organized around issues such as contagious diseases, food bacteriology, parasitology, water chemistry, and work health issues¹⁸. It was an important legal change in that previously physicians had the power only to give recommendations, in the new, socialist structure they had the right to take measures and to penalize citizens or institutions¹⁹.

Mother and Infant Protection

Mother and infant protection became one of the central medical priorities by the mid-1950s. In these debates on how to develop the institutional network that would help mothers and infants the role that the state and medical workers must play in protecting mothers and their infants was very much emphasized²⁰. Two directions were outlined by Imre Lóránt that would contribute to better reproductive results. The first one was the

¹³ Simonovits, “Népi Demokráciánk Egészségpolitikája,” 308.

¹⁴ Simonovits, 306.

¹⁵ This was the OKI, National Institution of Public Health [Országos Közegészségügyi Intézet].

¹⁶ Translates to Public Health and Epidemiological Station.

¹⁷ Simonovits, “Népi Demokráciánk Egészségpolitikája,” 310.

¹⁸ Vilmon, “Közegészségügyünk És Járványügyünk 10 Éves Fejlődése,” 113.

¹⁹ This is an important change that affected Roma people throughout the Socialist period (see for example Bernáth and Polyák).

²⁰ Drexler, “Hajtsuk Végre Maradékalanul Az Anya- És Gyermekvédelmi Rendeletet!”

law that made abortion illegal²¹, it was understood as a crime that endangers the life of the mother and kills the fetus. In medical cases²², when the life of the mother was in danger, abortion remained a legal option. But every miscarriage and in-utero intervention was required by ministerial statute to be reported²³. Another important direction was to reduce the infant mortality rates in the country. To achieve this goal, the state supported the establishment of infant-care facilities. In hospitals, divisions for prematurely born children were established to support the already existing child departments²⁴. The state also wanted

²¹ Imre Ozsváth and Sándor Radó reviewed the developments that occurred since the 1953 law that prohibited abortion (Ozsváth and Radó, 124). They emphasized that the law itself placed so much burden on maternity wards and hospitals that it was softened immediately in 1954 and gradually it was changed in 1956. The 1956 law (1047/1956 M.T. statute) basically relegated this right to the sphere of individuals; it was argued that women could decide best for themselves whether they want the child or not (Ozsváth and Radó, 121). But they also placed emphasis on the fact that the number of abortions increased as a result of the relaxed law and also because of the social and eugenic perspectives that direct the decision making of parents, and thus they argued abortion became a public health issue by the 1960s. The solution they proposed was systematically offered sexual instruction for teenagers; they agreed with the law that abortion is a basic personal right, but they also saw that women who opted for abortion were not familiar with the methods of sexual protection or they used various ineffective methods (such as irrigation with water after sexual intercourse), thus the primary task for Ozsváth and Radó was to work out methods for information distribution.

²² Gyula Nyitray and János Asbot discussed the lack of regulation regarding abortion until 1952 June that would have helped to save the life of women in case of any health danger. They wrote that this was an issue that was up to scientific and moral convictions of doctors to decide when they consider the case dangerous to recommend and perform abortion (Nyitray and Asbot, 82-83). Another problematic issue that they mentioned is the lack of clarification regarding the quality of the health problem. This practice was very problematic because in several cases women who really needed medical intervention could not get adequate help, they were forced by this chaotic system to find someone who understood their problem and perhaps similarly saw the necessity to terminate the pregnancy, and there were cases in which women ran out of time during this process and were forced to give birth. In 1952 the Health Ministry issued a statute that regulated procured abortion (81/34/1952). The statute stated that procured abortions could only be performed in institutions, it established and regulated statewide the first and second-degree committees who opinionated and allowed procured abortions. It also defined the diseases that accompanying pregnancies indicate abortions. It also allowed to the second-degree committees to decide in cases when the disease that affect the pregnant woman is not listed in the statute. In most cases tuberculosis served as the indication of procured abortions for both first and second degree committees (Nyitray and Asbot, 84).

²³ Lóránt, 1953, "Anya- És Gyermekvédelmi Feladataink," 71.

²⁴ Lóránt, 72.

to achieve by 1954 the presence of nurses in every part of the country²⁵. Thus monitoring and helping every mother and newborn child.

As a result of the regulation that the health ministry made – it extended mother protection by integrating midwives into the system of prenatal care and made it compulsory to report every pregnancy – the number of those women who appeared in pregnant counseling services grew rapidly. By 1954 more than one million women took part in these counseling services which in comparison to the 33000 women of the 1938 data is huge. The number of beds in obstetrical wards and in maternity hospitals also grew. And all of these changes resulted in a closer monitoring of pregnant women and the process of pregnancy itself, thus by 1954 the death of mothers per birth reduced to 5.3 percent per 10000 occasions (in 1945 this was 15.8 percent)²⁶. In a later publication, Lóránt placed emphasis on the further development of nurse system in Hungary²⁷. He suggested that it would be beneficial to extend its capacity in a manner that every village doctor would have a nurse accompanying him/her to closely monitor pregnancies and infant health.

Institutional Foundations of Public Health and Its Results

The most important task after the Second World War was to stop the spread of contagious diseases, thus one key area of health work concentrated on issues of public health and contagious diseases (Közegészségügy-járványügy). The stations of KÖJÁL started to be established state-wide from 1954 and by 1955 there were 24 stations across the country. In 1957 the organization of local groups that dealt with epidemiological issues was started in various districts in Budapest and at the same time in county towns (these groups were known as (Public Health and Epidemiological Service [Közegészségügyi és Járványügyi Szolgálat, KJSz]). These groups were responsible for controlling local epidemiological problems. An important structural change took place in 1968 regarding the organization when its name was changed from Állami Közegészségügyi Felügyelet to Állami Közegészségügyi-Járványügyi Felügyelet. In this new framework the duties were more precisely separated: (1) authority related and (2) other public health tasks²⁸. The re-

²⁵ According to Lóránt (1953) compared to 1938 the number of nurses more than quadrupled (from 344 to 1709) which was crucial since they help the work of physicians in ensuring the healthy process of pregnancy. It was their specific task to take care of the prematurely born, endangered infants and pregnant women. Because they worked closely with their panel-doctors (GPs) the statistics of infant mortality rates were significantly developed.

²⁶ Lóránt, 1955, “Anya- És Gyermekevédelmünk 10 Éves Fejlődése,” 107-108.

²⁷ Lóránt, 1956, “A Második Ötéves Terv Anya- És Gyermekevédelmi Feladatai,” 114.

²⁸ Kátay, “A Közegészségügy-Járványügy Fejlődése,” 86–87.

sults of epidemiological work from the 1950s until the end of the 1960s were remarkable: traditional epidemiological problems were reduced greatly in their significance. Important examples to underscore this success are the following: there was a serious outbreak of typhoid fever in 1954 which affected 158 people, but it ceased to be a serious problem after 1958 (there was no other recorded typhoid fever case after that time). Child-paralysis decreased from 1000 instances in the 1950s to 1-7 occurrences in the years of 1961-1968 as a result of systematic polio vaccinations²⁹. Kátay emphasized that the results were in general thanks to systematic vaccinations (polio, BCG) but also to the results of the work of KÖJÁL that encompassed activities from information distribution to environmental control.

Besides the obvious structural benefits for public health the functioning of KÖJÁL had its drawbacks as well. One of the most important negative aspects was the following: (1) they could not develop the quality of enlightening work regarding health issues, a problem that Gyula Vilmon³⁰ emphasized was that the institution did not use the help of the radio, the press, and other public institutions; and (2) they did not develop the antiseptic system in the villages. This latter one would contribute greatly to the cause of public hygiene³¹. Aladár Kátay, who was a pediatrician, similarly emphasized the interconnection between epidemiology and antiseptic work. Epidemiology without the latter is not efficient. He wrote that the training of occasional antiseptic workers was completed in all counties; the problem is that their knowledge is not applied when it should have been. He further placed emphasis on one preventive method of epidemiology and this was the protection against lice. Kátay explained that it is a very important field because, without efficient antiseptic action against lice, the infection of typhus would always be a constant problem³². He underscored his point by giving an example: from Budapest and Zala county where the combined action of KÖJÁL with the police, Red Cross, and the relevant state authorities achieved good results.

In addition to these introduced structural changes, the state introduced vaccination to control contagious diseases in the 1950s. These vaccinations were against contagious child paralysis, typhoid fever, diphtheria, and tuberculosis³³. Although the introduction of BCG vaccination was a significant step in the struggle against tuberculosis, in Hungary

²⁹ Kátay, 89.

³⁰ Vilmon, Gyula (1897-1966), physician, undersecretary of healthcare.

³¹ Vilmon, "A Közegészségügyi-Járványügyi Állomások Működésének Eredményei És Hiányosságai," 87.

³² Kátay, "A Közegészségügyi-Járványügyi Állomások Járványügyi Munkája," 94–95.

³³ Simonovits, "Népi Demokráciánk Egészségpolitikája," 310–311.

it remained a serious problem for the foreseeable future. Dénes Mosolygó noted³⁴ that it was known at that time that because of the organized preventive work and the introduction of BCG vaccinations in the Scandinavian countries tuberculosis started to lose its epidemiological character. The first vaccinations were carried out in 1923 and it was used only sporadically until the late 1940s. In 1947 and 1949, the state carried out a campaign in which 1.5 million people were vaccinated. The most significant development was the ministerial statute of 60/1953 in which it was mandated to vaccinate every newborn child.

Since 1949, according to Mosolygó, a slow but steady development can be observed³⁵. The obstacles that he listed were in relation to mistrust by citizens towards the vaccination. This was the primary reason why the statute was enacted: it was argued by physicians that further development in the issue of tuberculosis was not possible unless vaccinations were mandatory for everyone. And another related problem was the issue of re-vaccination. He explained that mistrust and lack of medical staff was the cause of bad results in re-vaccination. He stated that to develop the medical control of tuberculosis³⁶ it was necessary to organize more closely the work of general practitioners, nurses, crèches, pre-school, school doctors, pediatricians, epidemiological medical officers, and obstetrical wards.

In a ten years time-period significant developments were visible. Tibor Bakács³⁷, by reviewing the statistical results regarding the mortality rates of contagious diseases, stated

³⁴ Mosolygó, "A Tuberkulózis Elleni Küzdelem Továbbfejlesztése," 314.

³⁵ Mosolygó.

³⁶ Tibor Németh and his colleagues claimed that the public health work that aimed at finding defense mechanisms against tuberculosis could be divided into two phases: the first seventy years were characterized by passive protection, and the last thirty years were characterized by active measure such as vaccination (Németh, Nyárádi, and Vadász, "A Gümőkór Helyzete a Világban És Hazánkban (1882-1982)," 1309). They claimed that by 1983 with the method active protection the number of newly infected patients decreased to a yearly 5000 incidents. Ottó Schweiger similarly stated that the BCG vaccinations introduced in the early 1950s worked for children from their birth until their 15th birthday Schweiger, "A Tbc-Elleni Küzdelem Eredményei Magyarországon 100 Évvel a Mycobacterium Felfedezése Után.". After fifteen years the vaccination started to lose its effectiveness, thus re-vaccination was necessary. This meant that the age group between 15-50 years were considered high risk population thus their public health care were considered to be of high priority. They added that poverty and harmful habits such as alcohol consumption could contribute to ineffective containment of the disease. They also said that tuberculosis remained largely the problem of the elderly who were above 50 years, and mostly the new incidents of infection appeared in this group. At the same time, they argued that in the recent years tuberculosis ceased to be considered by medical professionals as an everyday health issue, thus they unfortunately often misinterpret the reappearing symptoms on patients, which made it harder to eradicate the problem entirely from the population but that was their long term goal.

³⁷ Bakács, Tibor (1912-1977), physician, university professor.

that roughly a 60 to 80 percent decrease could be measured in comparison to the statistics of 1953. He concluded that the systematic developments since the end of the Second World War placed Hungary into a circle of European countries whose health statistics regarding contagious diseases could be seen as average (previously Hungary was among the least successful countries in struggling with these health issues). He also underscored that one of the best results that Hungary managed to achieve was the decrease of tuberculous mortality rates thus tuberculosis ceased to be a lethal epidemiological disease by 1965³⁸. As a result of these efforts, Bakács suggested, medical and economic resources could be used to tackle other important issues that had recently emerged such as elderly tuberculosis infection, and malignant tumors. And other clinicians and researchers suggested a focus on the rising numbers of congenital malformations and their possible medical management.

The Direction of Standardizing and Managing Developmental Abnormalities

As early as the end of the 1950s discussions around congenital malformations began. Alfréd Berndorfer was among the first clinicians who urged his fellow colleagues to find common ground in understanding this matter. He wrote that there are three medical aims in tackling congenital malformations: researching the cause of the disease, treating the disease, and preventing the disease³⁹. In order to become successful in tackling this issue, it was necessary to set up a department that only dealt with congenital malformations to treat, research and contribute to the prevention of these disorders⁴⁰. This discussion only became much more acknowledged and thus influential in the 1960s with the advances of molecular biology.

The breakthrough that the molecular level of inheritance meant for medicine was enormous. With molecular understandings the issue of inheritable diseases was placed onto biochemical grounds. György Szemere⁴¹ distinguished three causes that could result in genetic harms: (1) mutagenic agents, (2) the pairings of recessive mutants, and (3)

³⁸ Bakács, "Magyarország Járványügyi Helyzetének Alakulása a Nemzetközi Adatok Tükrében – A Strukturális Változások Elemzése," 385–386.

³⁹ Berndorfer, "Egységes Szemlélet a Fejlődési Rendellenesség Kérdésében," 637.

⁴⁰ Berndorfer, 639.

⁴¹ Szemere, György (1931-2016), medical geneticist, university professor. He founded the first genetic counseling office outside of Budapest in 1964 and he was among the first clinicians who applied the results of cytogenetic analysis in genetic counseling (see Raskó and Horváth, "Szemere György Professzor (1931-2016), Az Első Vidéki Genetikai Tanácsadó Megteremtője."

the change of the genetic code for some unknown reason⁴². Basically, he argued that all struggles that aimed at preventing inheritable genetic diseases must focus on studying these causes. Studies should focus on for example radiation⁴³, or on the interaction of the human body with other chemical agents. And when pairings were at stake, genetic counseling was the adequate answer to prevent genetic disorders. And lastly, extensive studies were needed for the third issue: to understand more about the changes of the genetic code.

One of the key areas in the light of the above was the mortality rates of infants. The statistical results of Hungary were very poor in comparison to other European countries. The main problem that researchers such as Márius Hancsók and Endre Czeizel identified was fetal impairment. And they could only see development in this problem if research was focused on the different factors that could affect fetal development. The factors that they identified were microbiological causes (such as virus infections, bacterial infections, parasitological causes), alcohol consumption (they found out that coffee consumption was not harmful), smoking, ABO blood group incompatibility, the time of conception, and pathospermia. They claimed that the knowledge produced regarding these causes could help design modern preventive measures⁴⁴. The development of infant mortality statistics, according to them, was only possible with extensive research regarding these factors in order to design educational and medical measures that would contribute to prevention. Sziráki and his colleagues contributed to this discussion by similarly analyzing possible causes of perinatal mortality rates. Based on the data of the Central Statistical Agency (Központi Statisztikai Hivatal) they argued that congenital malformations had a significant role. They compared their data with international statistics in which congenital developmental malformations were identified as the third most important cause of perinatal mortality rates. Thus, they claimed, that to decrease mortality rates in Hungary, it was necessary to study the various different causes of the most relevant malformations⁴⁵. One of their key results was that they managed to consolidate the acceptance of other research results, for example, that among the various factors, the age of the mother plays an important role in the development of Down syndrome. More specifically, they claimed that after the age of 27 the incidence of Down-syndrome increases and the number triples in every 5 years⁴⁶. These studies,

⁴² Szemere, "A Humángenetika Eredményei És Távlatai."

⁴³ Czeizel, "A Terhesség Alatti Magzati Sugárkárosodások."

⁴⁴ Hancsók and Czeizel, "A Magzati Károsodások Kóreredetéről."

⁴⁵ Sziráki, Bodnár, and Szabó, "Magzati Fejlődési Rendellenességek Szülészeti Osztályunk 10 Éves Anyagában," 899.

⁴⁶ Sziráki, Bodnár, and Szabó, 901.

they suggested, could be important contributions to the accepted ‘modern’ preventive medical principles in which the main aim was to prevent developmental malformations in utero.

Biotechnological Developments in the Management of Reproduction

Development of the field of cytogenetics started in 1963. Scholars began to appreciate the role that it could play in clinical medicine. Sándor Nagy for example emphasized that this was a new field (only three years old at the time of the publication of his article) and has relatively few contributions to make, but one of them was the discovery of trisomy 21, the tripled 21 chromosome that indicates Down syndrome⁴⁷. Nagy noted that although it was very complicated at the time to do chromosome analysis it was still a promising method for diagnostics because if systematically applied it would contribute to the detection of chromosomal anomalies⁴⁸.

Important breakthroughs were necessary in order to accept cytogenetics as a method to help clinical diagnostics and prevention, and thus become a key tool in genetic counseling. According to Tamás Fleischmann⁴⁹ the following breakthroughs were paramount. In 1956 Tijo and Levan discovered that the normal chromosome number in a human being is 46. In 1959, the cause of Down-syndrome was pointed out by Lejeune and his colleagues; and because previous studies managed to explain the differences regarding the role of Barr sex chromatin in various (Turner, Klinefelter) syndromes, following this lead cytogeneticists primarily wanted to clarify the role that pathological sexual chromosomes play in various disorders. The most important contribution of Fleischmann’s review is that he spelled out the clinical consequences of the latest cytogenetic studies for clinical practice. Clinical cytogenetic studies were the most important and most rapidly developing subfield of medical genetics in the 1960s. These analytical works aimed at mapping

⁴⁷ This result was published by Lejeune, Gautier and Turpin in 1959 (Nagy, “Klinikai Chromosoma Vizsgálatok,” 1162). In their own research results they analyzed cases for Klinefelter syndrome, leukemia, and polycythemia-leukemia.

⁴⁸ Nagy, 1166.

⁴⁹ Fleischmann, “A Human Cytogenetika Újabb Eredményei (A Chromosoma-Vizsgálat Klinikai Jelentősége).”

the boundaries of ‘normal human chromosomes’⁵⁰ in order to facilitate easier and quicker identification processes⁵¹. Fleischmann emphasized the significance of population based cytogenetic studies that gather data in order to help automatization and shape the focus of medical concerns in designing screening procedures.

As a result of rapid developments of genetics in the 1950s and 60s medical genetics applied its insights in many spheres of medicine, thus by the end of the 1960s it was unimaginable to have modern gynecological assistance without cytogenetic laboratory⁵². Cytogenetic studies pointed out that at least one fifth of miscarriages had some kind of abnormal genetic structure. This abnormal structure can be differentiated into two larger groups: (1) gene mutations, which are molecular differences from the norm; (2) chromosome-mutations; these mutations could be the parts of chromosomes or whole chromosome mutations. The problem with these genetic mutations, they claimed was that these embryos can survive intra uterine life and can live for a short period. “These chromosome-aberrations which are compatible with life for a short period of time play role in pre- and perinatal-mortality”⁵³. The most frequent problems are autosomal trisomies with 45 percent; these are Edwards-syndrome, Down-syndrome, and Patau-syndrome. And they also refer to the problem of sex-chromosome anomalies, when their excess number (XXY, XXX) or the lack of them (X0) enables the development of abnormal variants. And sometimes sex-chromosomes develop into forms which are incapable of living (Y0). All of these could be detected researchers argued in prenatal testing thus could be prevented by abortion. In their studies Papp and his colleagues⁵⁴, emphasized that newborn retardation could be caused by chromosomal anomalies, therefore they suggested that prenatal genetic diagnostics could help in screening those problems. At the same time, they emphasized the significance of pre-conception and prenatal care of mothers in order to ensure the birth of children.

⁵⁰ One of the most researched field is the comparative aspects of sexual chromosomes. Studies conducted in this field for example in the 1960s focused on the ‘XYY syndrome’ because knowledge regarding this problem could significantly contribute to clinical diagnosis. The theory was that tall aggressive criminals share this karyotype, so the basic question is whether these people are indictable because of their genetic predetermination towards these crimes. Most of the geneticists thought that they were not punishable precisely because of this genetic predisposition (Fleischmann, “Klinikai Cytogenetika: 1968-1969”).

⁵¹ Fleischmann, 1623.

⁵² Papp et al., “Cytogenetikai Vizsgálatok Jelentősége a Szülészeti Praeventióban,” 1911.

⁵³ Papp et al., 1911.

⁵⁴ Papp et al., 1914.

The field of population based cytogenetic⁵⁵ research was not only interested in Down-syndrome but they were looking for other relatively frequent chromosomal variations as well. One of the general criticism of cytogenetics was that it deals with ‘clinical rarities’⁵⁶. According to this standpoint, chromosomal deficiencies are not epidemiological issues. To temper this position Károly Méhes⁵⁷ reviewed the recent global statistical data and pointed out that roughly 0.5 to 0.6 percent of live births show chromosome issues, from this amount, 0.2 percent are those mutations known as Down, Patau, and Edwards-syndrome. Méhes compared the mean value of global literature to that of Baranya county and stated that with minimal differences (Down syndrome, and Patau syndrome were more frequent for example, while Edwards syndrome was less frequent) they had similar results, thus similar epidemiological consequences could be inferred. He emphasized here, that these results make explicit that child-mortality rates are affected but also the occurrence of these diseases place burden (though not stated explicitly, but precisely because of this, it could be a burden both economic and personal) on healthcare institutions that take care of people with disabilities⁵⁸. He infers two conclusions as to how the results of cytogenetic studies could be used: (1) family planning should direct couples to aim at having children before the women reached the age of 32 to 35. To justify this suggestion, he drew on the literature that emphasized the significance of the age of the mother regarding Down syndrome at least since 1933 when Penrose published his findings but Méhes claimed that this is the case with other chromosome abnormalities as well. And (2) the new technology of prenatal diagnostics seemed promising to him in the work of preventing the occurrence of genetic disorders but in his time the economic and technological constraints of the society made it important to identify precisely the risk groups where amniocentesis would work best. (Méhes, among other clinicians, placed emphasis

⁵⁵ The strand of research called population cytogenetics that studies chromosome abnormalities according to geographical location and age groups emerged in the 1960s (Méhes, “Az Orvosi Cytogenetika 25 Éve: A Sexchromatintól a Preanatólis Diagnosztikáig,” 2211).

⁵⁶ Méhes, 2212.

⁵⁷ Méhes, Károly (1936-2007), pediatrician, medical geneticists, university professor, member of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences.

⁵⁸ Méhes, “Az Orvosi Cytogenetika 25 Éve: A Sexchromatintól a Preanatólis Diagnosztikáig,” 2212.

on the technique of amniocentesis⁵⁹ in order to ensure precise diagnosis that aids medical efforts to find inheritable anomalies with cytogenetic analysis.)

It is also important that he acknowledged the fact that cytogenetics reaches beyond the medical sphere by affecting family planning and love relationships by ‘perhaps’ influencing choices⁶⁰. In this claim, it was entailed that this eugenic technique of the state influences citizenship understanding thus it affects how individuals view their personal contribution to the society and what they also expect from their partners as conscious biological citizens who take into account the interest of their people.

⁵⁹ New ways of fetal diagnostics also contributed to the improvement of fetal health statistics which was among the most urgent public health matters of the 1960s. Fetal death during pregnancy considerably decreased by the end of the 60s, but during the perinatal period death results were significant just as in utero and puerperal death statistics. In order to facilitate improvements in these regards it was necessary to focus on factors such as isoimmunisation, toxemia, diabetes, over-carrying, infections, and other pregnancy related diseases – the same causes were linked by doctors to infant mortality rates as well. Ferenc Szontágh emphasized in these cases that to improve the related health statistics the best method was prevention. So he listed and explained the contemporary methods that could contribute to the goals of this preventive perspective. These methods are: endocrinology, amniocentesis, amnioscopy, fetal electrocardiography, microanalysis of fetal blood, Apgar-score, ultrasound diagnostics. Within endocrinology he discussed the quantitative definition of HCG (helps in the prognosis of miscarriage and judging whether an abortion was completely carried out), the measurement of steroid release (gives information about the placenta’s functionality and helps interpreting any danger regarding the status of the fetus), and oxytocin-sensitivity test (helps defining the time of birth-giving). Regarding amniocentesis, he emphasized that the amniotic fluid with precise analysis could be used for diagnostics or therapeutic purposes (and that it was relatively safe for both mothers and fetuses). Amnioscopy was an entirely safe method to diagnose asphyxia in utero. Fetal ECG was developed in 1906 to detect heart functionality and healthcare professionals integrated the method widely since then. The microanalysis of blood sample from the fetus is an important method to diagnose fetal metabolic disorders. The Apgar-score was developed to get a better understanding about the health status of infants. And lastly ultrasound diagnostics was a key development in exchanging x-ray tests to follow the different stages of fetal development. All of these methods were used in the Hungarian obstetrics practice and their most important contribution was in their possibility to improve fetal results both quantitatively and qualitatively. Thus, these methods contributed to negative eugenic aims by for example diagnosing fetal issues and justifying the medical indication of the termination of a pregnancy. But on the other hand these methods improved the health standards of those fetuses who for example were diagnosed with PKU and helped these infants to immediate access to therapeutic procedures, thus these methods function as important indicators to start a necessary healing procedure (based on Szontágh, “A Terhességi Diagnosztika Új Útjai.”).

⁶⁰ Méhes, “Az Orvosi Cytogenetika 25 Éve: A Sexchromatintól a Preanatólis Diagnosztikáig,” 2212.

Target Groups of Medical Genetics in the 1960s and 1970s

People with Mental Disorders

Mental retardation became an epidemiologically relevant issue because 3 to 4 percent of the population was affected. This is the reason why more and more studies appeared concerning congenital mental retardation. From the various different chromosomal anomalies, the most frequent were the Down-syndrome, Klinefelter-syndrome, and Turner-syndrome⁶¹. In addition to these issues, researchers were aware of the frequency of metabolic problems as well that could affect mental health (i.e. PKU or galactosemia).

In order to define more precisely the frequency of these above mentioned disorders in the Hungarian population Péter Cholnoky and his colleagues used a closed, small population sample of 140 children, boys and girls, aged between 4 to 14, who lived in a mental health asylum in Bóly, Baranya county. They concluded that in comparison to the average population, among the mentally retarded there were more intersex individuals, they also claimed that regarding other chromosome anomalies, the Turner, and Klinefelter-syndromes were significant, but the Down-syndrome was the most frequent in their sample group. They stated that “in these cases the proof of the diagnosis is important solely regarding the patients and the families prognosis,” and they also added that the health state of those who suffer from these chromosome anomalies could also be improved, so early diagnosis could be used to help them attain a better quality of life. The scientific contribution that has epidemiological consequences was that they managed to prove that in most cases mental disorders are genetically caused thus their results indicate the introduction of statewide screening programs for both newborns and infants⁶². They claimed that ethical and economic considerations also underscore their suggestion.

In a similar vein, László Szabó and his colleagues tried to raise attention of the genetic background of mental disabilities. They wrote that because of the increasing number of mentally disabled people their sheer number puts more strain on the country's economy thus it would be beneficial to find out what the genetic mutations were which were most prevalent in the Hungarian population and develop screening programs to help prevent mental disorders. They found chromosome-abnormalities that are directly connected to mental disability. The most frequent chromosome disorders that they mentioned were similarly Down, Turner, and Klinefelter-syndrome. In addition to these genetic disorders they claimed that by 1970 roughly 100 metabolic disorders were iden-

⁶¹ Cholnoky et al., “Genetikai Jellegű Vizsgálatok Súlyos Mentális Retardáltaknál,” 809.

⁶² Cholnoky et al., 814.

tified and in these diverse problems the most frequently shared symptom was mental disability⁶³. Mapping the frequency of these disorders would contribute to better results in genetic counseling. They also argued that by introducing newborn screening programs that target metabolic disorders genetic diagnostics could contribute to the prevention of mental problems.

The Body of Pregnant Women

There were numerous articles published in international medical journals about the effects of smoking on the fetus and on pregnancy in general but for Hungarian researchers it was only in the late 1960s that the effects of smoking became a focal point. Influenced by these works, László Makay and Jenő Vincze drew on these studies to compare smokers with non-smokers and concluded that among smokers more women gave birth prematurely and to newborns with less weight in general, but they also presupposed that smoking could play role in miscarriages and in other developmental malformations⁶⁴. They also noted that scholars published results in the international literature that analyzed the effects of passive smoking, such as the effects of smoking fathers on their pregnant wives, and the effects of smoking on spermatogenesis as well.

In addition to environmental effects and behavioural factors such as smoking other variables like the age of the mother were studied as well. It was widely known that the age of the mother was connected to Down syndrome as early as the first decade of the twentieth century. Lóránt Bodnár used this information as a starting point for their observations with his colleagues; they managed to prove that the age of the mother affected the appearance of congenital abnormalities. The population of mothers was divided according to their age groups and they observed that below the age of 20 the frequency of congenital abnormalities was less than 0,01 percent, while after the age of 40 the number of congenital disorders rapidly rose; but a steady growth was pointed out by them between these age groups⁶⁵. Bodnár claimed that based on the data that they collected from 1958 to 1967 they found that most frequently abnormalities occurred in first pregnancies, after several pregnancies, and above the age of 40. In addition to the age of pregnant women the age of their grandmothers became important. Papp and his colleagues for example

⁶³ Szabó et al., “Értelmi Fogyatékos Gyermekközösségben Végzett Genetikai Jellemű Szűrővizsgálatok,” 25.

⁶⁴ Makay and Vincze, “Dohányzás És Terhesség.”

⁶⁵ Bodnár, “Az Anyai Életkor És a Szülési Sorrend Befolyása a Veleszületett Fejlődési Rendellenességek Előfordulására,” 625.

discussed the significance of the age of grandmothers in the case of Down-syndrome⁶⁶. They argued that because high numbers of children born with Down syndrome were borne by young mothers so their age could not be the reason why their child had the disorder. This is why Papp and his colleagues argued that the age of the grandmother could be an important factor because she could have developed a form of mosaicism that she may have transmitted to her daughter (both of them asymptomatic) and her daughter may have given birth to a child with Down syndrome for this reason. They also posited that the role of the paternal grandmother's age and the possible mosaicism from that lineage could be more significant than was previously supposed.

Focus on Male Infertility

Of studies that started out from a focus on pregnant women, more precisely, how their habitual miscarriages happen, some shifted the focus to men, or more specifically to sperm analysis. In one study for example, Czeizel and his colleagues started out from the scientific claim that a significant amount of childless marriages were the result of male infertility and they also pointed towards the possible interrelationship of pathospermia to fetal impairments. So they suggested that the focus should be much more on the variables of fatherhood, and how this plays out in the process of conception. They claimed that "although the teratoid forms (of sperms) are infertile, their increased presence indicates pathological spermatogenesis. In the case of pathological spermatogenesis one must take into account microscopically invisible biochemical abnormalities that manifest themselves during fetal development and could result in the impairment of the fetus"⁶⁷. This remained an important direction in medical genetic research.

As is evident in a later published article by András Tóth and his colleagues in the 1980s it was an epidemiological issue since 10 to 15 percent of marriages had this problem. In their research, Tóth and his team focused on male infertility because they claimed that men were responsible in 30 percent of infertile marriages and they contributed to infertility in 20 percent of the cases. They drew on international literature and claimed that studies linked infertility to chromosomal abnormalities, thus they used the classification introduced in 1963 by Lionel S. Penrose to differentiate between infertile men. The first group included those who suffered from a lethal disorder and died before their reproductive age; the second group consisted of those who had a mental or somatic disorder and

⁶⁶ Papp, Váradi, and Szabó, "A Nagyanyai Életkor Vizsgálata Down-Szindrómában."

⁶⁷ Czeizel, Hancsók, and Viczián, "A Habitúan Vetelő Asszonyok Férjeinél Végzett Ondóvizsgálat Jelentősége," 1595.

were incapable of normal heterosexual relationship (i.e. people with Down syndrome); and the third group of people whose general health condition was fine but who suffered from some kind of chromosome problem that decreased their capability for fertility⁶⁸. The most important contribution of their study was that they pointed towards a relatively new gender aspect of genetic counseling, namely to suggest chromosome analysis for couples who visited counselors because of infertility problems⁶⁹. This chromosome test could significantly reduce the number of further examinations and could open the way for alternative solutions such as in vitro fertilization or perhaps adoption.

From Major to Minor Anomalies

Ilona Pazonyi and her colleagues discussed a shift in the focus of mapping diseases. In previous medical practices of anamnesis, the focus was on major anomalies. Clinicians wanted to register every major physical anomaly because it was the sign of serious disorder. This started to change during the mid-1960s when researchers started to point towards the significance of minor anomalies as possible indicators of serious invisible disorders. Minor anomalies are defined as physical signs, unusual morphological markers that do not have direct medical consequences; their significance is that they can indicate serious problems and they can be the signs of syndromes that could help clinicians in recognizing a disorder⁷⁰. An example that they gave for such a minor anomaly was the so called ‘single palmar crease’⁷¹ that is linked to Down syndrome, but researcher contemplated other morphological variations such as ear shape, head shape, and facial variations. They pointed out that the difficulty of using data collected about these differences lay in understanding them as minor anomalies or simple phenotype variations⁷². Minor anomalies are important mainly for recognizing multiplex disorders that point toward congenital diseases, thus they urged their colleagues to examine routinely such differences because these could help the early recognition of disorders and hence the therapeutic work could be started earlier.

⁶⁸ Tóth, Gaál, and László, “A Férfimedddőség Citogenetikai Háttére,” 1723.

⁶⁹ Tóth, Gaál, and László, 1728.

⁷⁰ Pazonyi et al., “A Minor Rendellenességek Gyakorisága És Jelentősége,” 3.

⁷¹ In the article the term simian crease (majombarázda) was used, but it is not used anymore because it conveys negative meaning, thus I chose to refer to this phenomenon by the contemporary terminology.

⁷² Pazonyi et al., “A Minor Rendellenességek Gyakorisága És Jelentősége,” 6.

Conclusion

The reasoning that occurred in the public health discussion concerning raising the health standards and health statistics of the country is important because it preceded genetic counseling that started in the late 1960s early 1970s. In this period from the '50s to the '70s, the dominant concern in medicine was the threat of contagious diseases. To successfully control these problems class issues such as environmental problems were placed at the forefront of discussions. Access to vaccinations again was approached from the perspective of class as the aim was to give equal protection to every citizen since this was in the interest of the society as well. This discussion was within an already defined preventive approach and this preventive approach had implicit eugenic values already incorporated into its mechanisms which were extended towards the management of reproduction. This is crucial because in the medical genetic period that started to take shape from the 1970s clinicians took for granted eugenic values that were already at work in the system. In this new phase, where clinicians were concerned with the management of healthy reproduction, gender perspectives were taking shape. In this discourse women were positioned as the primary responsible agents whose body came under closer medical surveillance. It is important that the accumulated medical knowledge was intended to enhance decision making on the part of women, but this decision making process was already burdened with eugenic expectations.

References

- Bakács, Tibor. "Magyarország Járványügyi Helyzetének Alakulása a Nemzetközi Adatok Tükrében – A Strukturális Változások Elemzése." *Orvosi Hetilap* 106, no. 9 (1965): 385–93.
- Bashford, Alison. "Epilogue: Where Did Eugenics Go?" In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Eugenics*, edited by Alison Bashford and Philippa Levine, 539–58. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Bernáth, Péter, and Laura Polyák. "KÉNYSZERMOSDATÁSOK MAGYARORSZÁGON." *Beszélő* 6, no. 6 (2001): 38–45. <http://beszelo.c3.hu/cikkek/kenyszermosdatasok-magyarorszagon>.
- Berndorfer, Alfréd. "Egységes Szemlélet a Fejlődési Rendellenesség Kérdésében." *Orvosi Hetilap* 99, no. 19 (1958): 637–39.
- Bodnár, Lóránt. "Az Anyai Életkor És a Szülési Sorrend Befolyása a Velezületett Fejlődési Rendellenességek Előfordulására." *Orvosi Hetilap* 111, no. 11 (1970): 625–28.

Brock, Dan W. *Life and Death: Philosophical Essays in Biomedical Ethics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Buchanan, Allen. *Beyond Humanity? The Ethics of Biomedical Enhancement*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Cholnoky, Péter, Károly Méhes, Endre Sulyok, Gábor Farkas, and László Major. “Genetikai Jellegű Vizsgálatok Súlyos Mentális Retardáltaknál.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 109, no. 15 (1968): 809–14.

Czeizel, Endre. “A Terhesség Alatti Magzati Sugárkárosodások.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 105, no. 46 (1964): 2161–67.

Czeizel, Endre, Máriusz Hancsók, and Mihály Viczián. “A Habitúan Vetélő Asszonyok Férjeinél Végzett Ondóvizsgálat Jelentősége.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 108, no. 34 (1967): 1591–95.

Drexler, Miklós. “Hajtsuk Végre Maradékalanul Az Anya- És Gyermekevédelmi Rendeletet!” *Népegészségügy* 34, no. 3 (1953): 66–68.

Fleischmann, Tamás. “A Human Cytogenetika Újabb Eredményei (A Chromosoma-Vizsgálat Klinikai Jelentősége).” *Orvosi Hetilap* 108, no. 50 (1967): 2353–59.

———. “Klinikai Cytogenetika: 1968-1969.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 112, no. 28 (1971): 1623–27.

Foucault, Michel. *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1978-79*. Edited by Michel Senellart. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.

———. *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archeology of Medical Perception*. London: Routledge, 1991.

Hancsók, Máriusz, and Endre Czeizel. “A Magzati Károsodások Kóreretéről.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 107, no. 12 (1966): 539–43.

Harris, John. *Enhancing Evolution: The Ethical Case for Making People Better*. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press, 2007.

Kátay, Aladár. “A Közegészségügy-Járványügy Fejlődése.” *Népegészségügy* 51, no. 2 (1970): 86–89.

———. “A Közegészségügyi-Járványügyi Állomások Járványügyi Munkája.” *Népegészségügy* 37, no. 4 (1956): 92–95.

Kevles, Daniel J. “Eugenics and Human Rights.” *The British Medical Journal* 319, no. 7207 (1999): 435–38.

———. “Genetics in the United States and Great Britain, 1890-1930: A Review with Speculations.” *Isis* 71, no. 3 (1980): 441–55.

———. *In the Name of Eugenics: Genetics and the Uses of Human Heredity*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986.

Kevles, Daniel J. “Controlling the Genetic Arsenal.” *The Wilson Quarterly* 16, no. 2 (1992): 68–76.

Larsen, D. “Biology and the Emergence of Anglo-American Eugenics Movement.” In *Biology and Ideology from Descartes to Dawkins*, edited by D. R. Alexander and R. L. Numbers, 165–91. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2010.

Lóránt, Imre. “A Második Ötéves Terv Anya- És Gyermekvédelmi Feladatai.” *Népegészségügy* 37, no. 5 (1956): 113–16.

———. “Anya- És Gyermekvédelmi Feladataink.” *Népegészségügy* 34, no. 3 (1953): 71–72.

———. “Anya- És Gyermekvédelmünk 10 Éves Fejlődése.” *Népegészségügy* 36, no. 4–5 (1955): 107–12.

Makay, László, and Jenő Vincze. “Dohányzás És Terhesség.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 109, no. 34 (1968): 1867–69.

Méhes, Károly. “Az Orvosi Cytogenetika 25 Éve: A Sexchromatintól a Preanatólis Diagnosztikáig.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 114, no. 37 (1973): 2209–13.

Mosolygó, Dénes. “A Tuberkulózis Elleni Küzdelem Továbbfejlesztése.” *Népegészségügy* 38, no. 12 (1957): 314–22.

Nagy, Sándor. “Klinikai Chromosoma Vizsgálatok.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 104, no. 25 (1963): 1162–67.

Németh, Tibor, Iván Nyárádi, and Imre Vadász. “A Gümőkór Helyzete a Világban És Hazánkban (1882-1982).” *Orvosi Hetilap* 124, no. 22 (1983): 1309–12.

Nyitrai, Gyula, and János Asbot. “A Terhesség Művi Megszakítására Felállított I. És II. Fokú Bizottságok Eddigi Munkájának Értékelése.” *Népegészségügy* 34, no. 3 (1953): 82–84.

Ozsváth, Imre, and Sándor Radó. “Tapasztalataink Terhességmegszakításokkal Kapcsolatban.” *Népegészségügy* 42, no. 4 (1961): 121–25.

Papp, Zoltán, Sándor Gardó, Gábor Herpay, and Sándor Árvay. “Cytogenetikai Vizsgálatok Jelentősége a Szülészeti Praeventióban.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 110, no. 33 (1969): 1911–15.

Papp, Zoltán, Éva Váradi, and Zoltán Szabó. “A Nagyanyai Életkor Vizsgálata Down-Szindrómában.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 116, no. 48 (1975): 2838–40.

Pazonyi, Iona, Endre Czeizel, István Ludányi, Károly Méhes, Kálmán Nagy, Ferencné Obál, Zoltán Papp, József Skapinyec, Gábor Szabó, and Róbert Vajda. “A Minor Rendellenességek Gyakorisága És Jelentősége.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 116, no. 1 (1975): 3–8.

Raskó, István, and Emese Horváth. “Szemere György Professzor (1931-2016), Az Első Vidéki Genetikai Tanácsadó Megteremtője.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 158, no. 50 (2017).

Roll-Hansen, Nils. “Conclusion: Scandinavian Eugenics in the International Context.” In *Eugenics and the Welfare State - Norway Sweden, Denmark, and Finland*, edited by Gunnar Broberg and Nils Roll-Hansen, 259–71. East Lansing, Michigan: Michigan State University Press, 2005.

Rose, Nikolas. *The Politics of Life Itself*. Princeton NJ, Oxfordshire UK: Princeton University Press, 2007.

Schweiger, Ottó. “A Tbc-Elleni Küzdelem Eredményei Magyarországon 100 Évvel a Mycobacterium Felfedezése Után.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 124, no. 28 (1983): 1667–70.

Simonovits, István. “A Gyógyító-Megelőző Ellátás Fejlődésének Tíz Éve.” *Népegészségügy* 36, no. 4–5 (1955): 88–106.

———. “Népi Demokráciánk Egészségpolitikája.” *Népegészségügy* 38, no. 12 (1957): 305–14.

Szabó, László, Ottó Schmidt, Kálmán Kovács, László Klujber, Péter Cholnoky, Károly Méhes, and Endre Sulyok. “Értelmi Fogyatékos Gyermekek Közösségben Végzett Genetikai Jellegű Szűrővizsgálatok.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 111, no. 1 (1970): 25–28.

Szemere, György. “A Humángenetika Eredményei És Távlatai.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 105, no. 51 (1964): 2401–8.

Sziráki, László, Lóránt Bodnár, and József Szabó. “Magzati Fejlődési Rendellenességek Szülészeti Osztályunk 10 Éves Anyagában.” *Orvosi Hetilap* 110, no. 16 (1969): 899–902.

Szontágh, Ferenc. "A Terhességi Diagnosztika Új Útjai." *Orvosi Hetilap* 109, no. 11 (1968): 561–70.

Tóth, András, Magdolna Gaál, and János László. "A Férfimeddőség Citogenetikai Hátere." *Orvosi Hetilap* 123, no. 28 (1982): 1723–28.

Tydén, Mattias. "The Scandinavian States: Reformed Eugenics Applied." In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Eugenics*, 363–80, 2010.

Vilmon, Gyula. "A Közegészségügyi-Járványügyi Állomások Működésének Eredményei És Hiányosságai." *Népegészségügy* 37, no. 4 (1956): 85–89.

———. "Közegészségügyünk És Járványügyünk 10 Éves Fejlődése." *Népegészségügy* 36, no. 4–5 (1955): 112–25.

Weindling, Paul. *Health, Race, and German Politics between National Unification and Nazism, 1870-1945*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

SABER QECHAI

Linguistic Rights of Indigenous Peoples in Canada

Pro&Contra 5

No. 2 (2021) 57–79

<https://doi.org/10.33033/pc.2021.2.57>

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to provide an overall picture of the current situation of Canada's Indigenous languages by analyzing the historical and political context in which they have evolved, the history of the precariousness of the languages, and the legal instruments, solutions and measures already taken for the revitalization and protection of these languages. On the one hand, our aim is to provide a global picture of the situation in Canada by not going into too many details, for example, in case of legislations that are different in each province. On the other hand, to put some emphasis on the current situation in the province of Quebec. While working on this paper, we tried to be critical, for example, by analyzing the laws and their shortcomings. However, we also tended to remain objective, even though the subject of language policy and the defense and promotion of minority languages is close to our concern, because of the death of several languages in the world, predicted also by many thinkers.

Keywords: Language Reclamation, Indigenous People, Linguistic Heritage, Linguistic Rights

Historical Context

Today, almost every anthropologist and archaeologist shares the idea that the history of settlement in Canada is intertwined with natural phenomena such as the ice age and ice melt. Physical and linguistic scientific evidence exists to show that by about 30,000 years ago, or probably even earlier, humans were already present on the American continent and took advantage of favorable changes in environmental conditions. Historians such as Nelles and Dickason¹ believe that the first peoples of the continent came from Asia across the continental bridge, also known as the Behring Strait, which linked Alaska and Siberia, thanks to the retreat of waters trapped in ice and low ocean levels that made crossing possible on foot. Although this theory of the settlement of Canada is the most documented and widespread, there is no reason to conclude that other feasible routes, for example with boats, were not also used for the crossing. The reason for the settlement of the continent may lie in the hunter-gatherer lifestyle of the early peoples, who, according to some speculation, followed herds of mammoths, bison, and other animals for which the Strait provided ample forage.²

In this way, the first peoples of Canada, the indigenous peoples, arrived and inhabited the continent. It is important to clarify that Indigenous peoples include First Nations (status and non-status Indians), Métis (who have mixed ancestry, both Indigenous and

¹ Henry Vivian Nelles, *A Brief History of Canada* (Montreal: Fides, 2005), 18.

² Dickason Olive, *The First Nations of Canada* (St. Laurent: Les éditions du Septentrion, 1996), 23–25.

European), and Inuit (in common parlance, also known as Eskimos, peoples of North America).³ The societies of these early peoples were characterized by displacement and continuous adaptation to a changing environment and depended primarily on agricultural activity, fishing, and hunting. These societies were exemplary for several reasons: on the one hand, the first peoples had a close relationship with the land and lived in harmony with it, thanks to which peoples had a vast knowledge of natural resources and the ways of using them (food, medicine, tools for survival, etc.). Furthermore, they considered it their responsibility to preserve the land so that it could produce enough for their community to feed, and for this reason they also had a deep respect towards their own gods such as the gods of rain. Likewise, in their view, they all came from the land, and it gave them their identity,⁴ an essential part of which was language and community membership. On the other hand, their relationship with each other, the balance and harmony between individuals, and lack of conflict in Native communities was also surprising and admirable to early Europeans.⁵

Throughout the 15th-16th centuries, the number of European explorations took a leap forward, the reason being the hope of European states to seek out lands to claim in the name of Christianity and to find a direct route to the East, which attracted them with its exotic goods, especially spices and silk. Thus, following the Spanish and Portuguese explorers, other countries, including Italy, France and England, also joined the expeditions. First, in 1497, an Italian immigrant to England, Giovanni Caboto, set foot on Newfoundland and claimed it in the name of England, while the first Frenchman to arrive to Canada was Jacques Cartier, who erected a cross in the name of the king of France (manifestation of the notion of contact).⁶

This was the first attempt by the French people to claim territories on the continent. Cartier made three trips to Canada, the first in 1534, when while discovering the Gulf of St. Lawrence, he met a group of people from Stadacona (current Quebec City), and returned to France with the two sons of Donnacona (the local chief). His goal was to have them learn the French language and train them as interpreters to help him in the fur trade, but on his second voyage (1535–1536) he realized that they remained loyal to their people, so he kidnapped them together with Donnacona himself to France and he never allowed

³ Jacinthe Dion, Hains Jennifer, Ross Amélie, and Delphine Collin-Vézina, “Residential Schools: Inter-generational Impacts,” *Enfances Familles Générations*, vol. 25 (2016): 2.

⁴ Task Force on Aboriginal Languages and Cultures (TFALC), *The Beginning of a New Time: First Report Towards a Strategy for Revitalizing First Nations, Inuit and Métis Languages and Cultures* (Gatineau: Canadian Heritage, 2005), 24.

⁵ Dickanson, *The First Nations*, 45.

⁶ Nelles, *A Brief History of Canada*, 39.

them to return to their homeland. Once Cartier arrived back in Canada, his appropriation of indigenous territories, insistence on the importance of the Christian religion and the cross, not to mention the kidnapping of people, unsurprisingly alienated the indigenous people (a manifestation of the notion of conflict).⁷ Eventually, after constant conflict, harassment and slaughter of settlers, Cartier gave up the attempt to colonize the territory.

This was just the beginning of the wave of European explorations in Canada. During the 16th century, the period of religious wars, the French and the English had to concentrate their military troops on other territories, which explains why it took until the year 1600 for the French to decide to try again to establish a colony. Therefore, a new impetus was given by the fishing and fur trade with the Amerindians (manifestation of the concept of relationship). After being granted a royal monopoly by the King of France in 1608, Samuel de Champlain, a cartographer and sailor, established a permanent “habitation” at Quebec City that served as a fortified trading post.⁸ However, France’s dominance did not last long, and its position was soon undermined, as in the meantime the Dutch also established a trading post in 1614 (plus an alliance with the Iroquois), as did the English with the founding of the Hudson’s Bay Company in 1670 and the founding of Halifax in Nova Scotia.

The mutual influence of languages

Indigenous languages in Canada and in Quebec particularly are part of 3 large language families which themselves are divided into several branches and sub-branches creating region-specific dialects: Eskimo/Aleut family (in the North American Arctic, e.g., Inuktitun or Inuktitut), Iroquoian family (in central and eastern North America, e.g., Huron or Mohawk), and Algonquian family (in northern America, e.g., Micmac or Cree).⁹ Although it can be assumed that the first peoples all came to Canada from the same continent, the languages they spoke evolved in different ways due to various influences and continuous displacement. However, they do have certain linguistic characteristics in common, such as their polysynthetic nature which makes them enormously efficient in the number of words used. Therefore, as Drapeau points out, while Indo-European languages require a sentence to convey a message, indigenous languages (e.g., Inuktitut) can achieve this from a single verb base. This is because these languages have the

⁷ Nelles, *A Brief History of Canada*, 39–44.

⁸ Dickason, *The First Nations of Canada*, 90–94.

⁹ Dorais, Louis-Jacques, “Les langues autochtones d’hier à aujourd’hui,” In *Les langues autochtones du Québec*, ed. Jacques Maurais (Quebec: Les Publications du Québec, 1992), 67–72.

markings that verbs can carry to express both person and number, which allows a lot of grammatical information (subject, verb, object) to be put together in one word.¹⁰ In addition, almost all indigenous languages are also languages of oral tradition, which explains why even today there are very few written resources (such as grammars, dictionaries, recordings, etc.) thereby preventing the intergenerational transmission of languages and ancestral knowledge.

In this context, it is easy to understand the uniqueness of these languages that have paid a high price for encountering European languages. According to Vézina, “the traces of the influence of one language on another always inform us about the relationship between the communities involved.”¹¹ This statement is relevant to the Canadian history, even though at the beginning, the negative linguistic influence on indigenous languages was not so palpable since there was a certain curiosity on the part of both peoples to learn more about each other’s cultures and languages. In retrospect, it’s obvious that there was a political interest behind this curiosity, especially the colonization of the territory and the evangelization of early peoples, which also pushed missionaries to practice translation and to know better the native languages. Nevertheless, these languages, the internal dynamics and mutual contacts of which had until then been the only factors of change, gradually became oppressed and marginalized and consequently, the ethnolinguistic situation of Canada was completely disrupted.¹²

The linguistic influence between the 17th and 19th centuries is documented in written sources that testify to borrowings from Amerindian culture, also called *amérindianisms* by Vézina, which gradually entered the French language even if their number was not very high. Some of these words were related to indigenous culture (kayak, moccasin, totem, igloo), fauna (names of fish, land animals and birds such as cacaoui “duck of the arctic regions”) and flora (names of fruits and plants) and were certainly adopted because of the close relationship of the indigenous people with nature as well as the adaptation of Europeans to a sometimes-extreme environment. These traces of language influence also show that indigenous people were willing to help European settlers to tame the environment and survive (building canoes and making snowshoes) by transmitting their knowledge of nature.¹³ However, if this is indeed the case, it can be seen that the impact of these encounters goes beyond the linguistic domain to manifest itself at the societal

¹⁰ Drapeau Lynn, *Les langues autochtones du Québec: un patrimoine en danger* (Québec: Presses de l’Université du Québec, 2011), 8.

¹¹ Vézina Robert, “Amerindiens and Franco-Canadiens: Une rencontre inscrite dans la langue,” *Cap-aux-Diamants*, no. 96 (2009): 21.

¹² Dorais, “Les langues autochtones,” 64–67.

¹³ Vézina “Amerindiens,” 21–24.

level. On the other hand, it can also be noted that Indo-European languages have had an influence, although not a very positive one, on native languages as well, especially on the syntactic level. For example, as Mackenzie and Brittain point out,¹⁴ it can be observed that there is a shift in Indigenous languages towards a more English or French sentence structure as in the example “âhkushtikuanâu” (he/she has a headache) which some young people render as two words “âhkushû ushtikuân” instead of integrating the noun with the verb. This is only one example that shows the devastating effect of the Indigenous-European encounter.

From the 19th century on, the adoption of the assimilation policy changed everything at a linguistic and social level. In fact, linguistic and cultural diversity was no longer viewed favorably by the European powers, whose goal was to integrate the Indigenous people into the dominant culture, which undoubtedly also had a negative effect on indigenous languages. The gradual *minorisation* of languages was because speaking an indigenous language was seen as an obstacle to the advance of European civilisation and Christianity. This policy, which separated families from each other and prevented the transmission of knowledge, led to the disappearance of languages, and caused trauma for millions of people.

The “language dynamic”, victim of the assimilation policy

Today, there are approximately 61 Indigenous languages spoken in Canada that, from the period of colonization, have been weakened to varying degrees and are threatened with extinction.¹⁵ Their vitality, power, and attraction, that is, their dynamics, have changed considerably over time because the balance of power has influenced both the code and the behavior of these languages. The imposition of French and later English, as well as the prohibition of the use of Native languages, significantly changed the conceptual system of representation adapted by the Native culture and the use of language in social and individual life.¹⁶ Until the arrival of the first Europeans, the dynamics of Native languages

¹⁴ Mackenzie Marguerite, and Julie Brittain, *Translation as a way to save Indigenous languages* (Circuit, no. 139, 2019). <https://www.circuitmagazine.org/dossiers-139/translation-as-a-way-to-save-indigenous-languages>, accessed July 29, 2022.

¹⁵ Task Force on Aboriginal Languages and Cultures (TFALC), *Towards a new beginning: a foundational report for a strategy to revitalize First Nation, Inuit and Métis languages and cultures* (Gatineau: Canadian Heritage, 2005), 33.

¹⁶ Mackey William Francis, *Prolégomènes à l'analyse de la dynamique des langues* (DiversCité Langues, 2000). <https://www.teluq.quebec.ca/diverscite/SecArtic/Arts/2000/mackey/ftxt.htm>, accessed September 8, 2021.

depended primarily on contact between indigenous communities and the use and transmission of languages that held social and spiritual values for Native Americans.

Even today, language plays a central role in the lives of the indigenous people and is considered “the cornerstone of indigenous philosophy,” which besides serving as a means of communication, also reflects the relationship of peoples to their Creator, their attitude towards others, their beliefs, and values. Its importance is well manifested in the fact that it has the power to form and hold together the community that is bound by the same culture, the same ethnic origin, and the collective desire to preserve its distinctive character and political autonomy. It should not be forgotten either that the language testifies the relation of the people with the earth, their inseparable connection with nature where the spiritual ceremonies take place, and it is also the means to perpetuate the past in the present. In this way, it tells us that the passage of time does not have to mark the end of an event, because according to the conception of Indigenous peoples, the past always surrounds us through language and oral narratives that contribute to the transmission and vivification of history and ancestral knowledge.¹⁷

In this context, it is easy to understand why the cultural and linguistic upheaval brought about by European dominance and the adoption of the policy of assimilation had irreversible consequences for the Indigenous people and their languages from the 16th century onwards, including the weakening and loss of some Indigenous languages and cultures. The death of languages such as Abenaki or Huron, and the likelihood of the disappearance of other languages in the near future such as Mohawk or Mandan highlight the magnitude of the current linguistic situation.¹⁸ The reasons for this linguistic instability are varied, but most lie in the historical context of Canada: encounters, population movement, epidemics, wars, and the desire of Europeans to conquer and control have all greatly reduced the native population and weakened the languages spoken, to which the policy of assimilation has also contributed.

¹⁷ TFALC, *Towards a new beginning*, 20–30.

¹⁸ Maurais Jacques, *Les langues autochtones du Québec* (Québec: Les Publications du Québec, 1992), 13–14.

The impact of assimilation policy practices

The effects of the assimilation policy in Canada are numerous and often influence the life of the entire family or the Indigenous community, although there are among them people who have not personally experienced the tragedy of these systems. This is because of the unimaginable hardships that people who were taken from their families at a young age have undergone: they are unable to overcome the trauma experienced in the residential schools or in the protection system and they start a family while being unable to meet the emotional needs of their own children. This is known as “the intergenerational cycle of childhood victimization.”¹⁹

Some of the most common symptoms of this trauma include mental, i.e., psychological problems, such as post-traumatic stress disorder, substance abuse disorders, major depression, or dysthymic disorder (affective disorder), but residential school attendance “is also associated with a higher likelihood of chronic health problems or poor general health” that can lead to premature death.²⁰ It should not be forgotten either that there were people who being unable to cope with the mental pressure committed suicide either in the residential schools or after their time there.

However, there are still other impacts, the rather physical impacts due to excessive corporal punishment, physical violence, and sexual abuse. The Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada points out that families and individuals who attended residential schools are becoming “increasingly dysfunctional, which results in unemployment, poverty, family violence, drug and alcohol abuse, family breakdown, sexual violence, prostitution, etc.: the legacy of residential schools.”²¹ For these reasons, the physical violence and humiliation experienced in the residential schools influenced the relationship of these individuals with each other (resulting in relationships without affection) and, in one way or another, provided a poor role model for the exresidents.

Nevertheless, the passage through the residential school and child welfare systems has also had a serious impact on the identity of Indigenous peoples. The systems have been successful in achieving their goal, which is also palpable in the statement of John Tootoosis, one of the former residents of Delmas School in Saskatchewan: “When an Indian came out of one of these institutions, it was like putting him between two walls of a room and leaving him hanging in the middle. On the one side, the things he had learned

¹⁹ Jacinthe, Hains, Ross, and Collin-Vézina, “Residential Schools: Intergenerational Impacts,” 5.

²⁰ Jacinthe, Hains, Ross, and Collin-Vézina, “Residential Schools: Intergenerational Impacts,” 5.

²¹ Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRCC), *They Came for the Children: Canada, Aboriginal Peoples and Residential Schools* (2012), 77–78. <http://publications.gc.ca/site/fra/9.639663/publication.html>, accessed August 12, 2022.

from his original community and their way of life were being erased; and on the other side, the ways of doing and being of the White People, he would never be able to understand for lack of proper instruction, and he would not be able to make them his own.”²²

This quote shows us that the systems left disorder and doubts behind about the identity of individuals who had no idea to which world they belonged. Upon returning to their communities, the ex-residents were unable to speak their native language and for this reason they found themselves isolated even from their own families. They were unable to speak their language because Indigenous languages were suppressed in the residential schools and because the children taken from their families were not adopted by Indigenous families on purpose. Based on this fact, the systems have been successful in devaluing and repressing Indigenous cultures and languages while instilling shame in students about their origins and undermining their self-esteem. Some residential school survivors even refused to teach their children their native language and culture because of the contempt and prejudice they saw being associated with their origins, which undoubtedly contributed to the current state of Indigenous languages.²³

Considering this, one can reinforce the idea that language is an essential part of Indigenous identity and the preservation of it ensures the survival of Indigenous people not only as individuals, but also as members of a community.²⁴ Thus, the prohibition of speaking their own language made it difficult for the community to survive, which some would argue counts as “cultural genocide.” The practice of assimilation policy and its impact on Indigenous peoples have long been recognized, but we are just beginning to recognize their basic rights with which they could more effectively fight against the disappearance of their language.

Obstacles to legal guarantees of indigenous peoples’ linguistic rights

For the first Europeans, the policy of assimilation aimed at creating a common language and eliminating linguistic diversity served to ensure freedom, national unity, and equality of citizens. The prevailing idea behind the policy was to foster democracy by introducing a common language and assimilating linguistic minorities into the dominant population. Bastarache points out that this theory is much contested, for example, by linguistic mi-

²² TRCC, *They Came for the Children*, 78 (Translated from French by Saber Qechai).

²³ TRCC, *They Came for the Children*, 160.

²⁴ Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRCC), *Honouring the Truth, Reconciling for the Future: Summary of the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada* (Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2015), 158.

norities who consider their language a value and an essential part of their identity. In addition, he also raises the thorny question of whether all these measures were done to foster democracy and “whether it is really necessary to sacrifice the linguistic and cultural heritage of humanity in the name of a false conception of freedom, equality and democracy.”²⁵

In an ideal society, one should not necessarily choose between one’s mother tongue and democracy; both should coexist, and linguistic rights should be the pillar of a democratic society. To take an example that illustrates the coexistence of these two values, we can mention the European Union (EU), which has a legal personality and is renowned for its democratic role. In the EU, 24 languages are recognized as official languages (even small ones like Irish, Hungarian, or Slovak) and thus have a legal status. In addition, the European Union also declares multilingualism among its founding principles and takes positive measures towards linguistic minorities.²⁶ However, in order to guarantee these rights to citizens, their principles had to be set in treaties and charters such as one of the overarching documents of the Union: the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union.²⁷ So, following the example of the EU, if we would like to ensure the survival of Indigenous languages in Canada, rights and legal recognition would certainly be the first step. However, there are several reasons why legal recognition is difficult. Firstly, the legal process itself is slow and laborious, and even today, some believe that there are only two types of interests in the state that should be represented: that of the individuals and that of the collectivity, which is represented by the sovereign state, including the government and its institutions.²⁸

Secondly, another difficulty arises from the question of who is responsible for languages – the federal state or the provinces? In other words, who has the constitutional right and jurisdiction to promote ancestral languages and guarantee linguistic rights to minority communities? In reality, the federal government is responsible for areas such as defense, currency, navigation, airports, reserves, but also for everything related to Native American culture, while among the powers attributed to the provinces, we can mention natural resources, property rights or even education. It is evident from this list that there are overlaps in some areas between the two levels of government (Native American culture and education) depending on the legislative powers assigned to them by the Consti-

²⁵ Bastarache Michel et al., *Les droits linguistiques* (Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013), 7.

²⁶ Ravon Perri, and Dubois Justin, “Les droits linguistiques en droit international,” In *Les droits linguistiques au Canada*, eds. Michel Bastarache and Michel Doucet (Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013), 175.

²⁷ Ravon, and Dubois, “Les droits linguistiques,” 161–163.

²⁸ Bastarache, *Les droits linguistiques*, 19–20.

tution. It is for this reason that “the area of language use is [also] a joint federalprovincial jurisdiction,” which explains the difficulty of taking effective actions and drafting legislation regarding the linguistic rights of Indigenous peoples.²⁹

Furthermore, another factor related to Indigenous rights concerns their fundamental nature, which is the subject of many debates. Bastarache draws attention to the fact that for some, linguistic rights are not among the fundamental rights inherent to every individual such as freedom of conscience, religion, freedom of thought or opinion that naturally exist without making them into laws.³⁰ However, this is not the case regarding indigenous languages. Given that monolingualism (the dominance of English or French) was in effect for several decades, Canadian provincial governments began to address the issue of language rights of Indigenous peoples later³¹ and it was not until 1985 that in the *Reference Re Manitoba Language Rights*, that the Supreme Court considered language rights as fundamental rights.³²

Finally, it should also be noted that language is maintained and invigorated by usage, without which legislation is useless. For indigenous languages in Canada, their use is guaranteed not only by the legal framework established by the state or province, but also by the legal knowledge of the citizens and their conscious attitude to emphasize their rights. The implication is that language rights are threatened not by learning the state language, English or French used by the majority, but by not exercising the guaranteed rights and passing on ancestral languages to future generations.

The legal path ahead is long and full of difficulties, and unfortunately, it is still far from being completed in a short time. Even though there are countless laws and conventions in existence relating to language rights, they are often contradictory and not very explicit when it comes to the rights of Indigenous peoples. This may explain why it is possible that among all Canadian provinces, Quebec is almost the only one where today the language rights granted to Indigenous people are explicitly set out in the Charter of the French Language: “The National Assembly recognises the right of the Indigenous and Inuit peoples of Quebec, descendants of the country’s first inhabitants, to maintain and develop their original language and culture.”³³

²⁹ Leclerc Jacques, *La politique des langues officielles du gouvernement fédéral* (Québec : L’aménagement linguistique dans le monde, 2019). <https://www.axl.cefan.ulaval.ca/monde/>, accessed September 03, 2022.

³⁰ Bastarache, *Les droits linguistiques*, 23–24.

³¹ Leclerc Jacques. *Les droits linguistiques des autochtones* (Québec : L’aménagement linguistique dans le monde, 2015). http://www.axl.cefan.ulaval.ca/amnord/Quebec-8Autochtones-droits_Lng.htm, accessed September 04, 2022.

³² Bastarache, *Les droits linguistiques*, 26.

³³ Leclerc. *Les droits linguistiques*. Translated from French by Saber Qechai.

Constitutional and federal legislation relating to Indigenous linguistic rights

Since the 1970s, there were strong efforts to address the issue of declining indigenous languages on the national level and to amend existing laws, for example, the Constitution, incorporating recognition of ancestral languages.³⁴ First and foremost, it is important to mention that Native American languages do not have any specific official recognition even in the Canadian Constitution, both in the 1867 and 1982 constitutions. The 1867 Constitution makes no mention of indigenous peoples and their rights except in paragraph 91 in an implicit way in which it guarantees the power of the federal government to make laws in relation to “Indians and Lands reserved for the Indians,”³⁵ but the question of language is covered with a thick veil because it remains unclear whether this jurisdiction of the federal government also extends to language or not.

Moreover, a similar uncertainty combined with legal confusion also comes from the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Part I of the Constitution Act, 1982, which recognizes linguistic rights for official language communities (English, French), but does not mention indigenous linguistic rights. Meanwhile, it is interesting to look at section 15(1) in which linguistic rights could be implied even though this is not the case: “Every individual is equal before and under the law and has the right to equal protection and equal benefit of the law without discrimination and, in particular, without discrimination based on race, national or ethnic origin, color, religion, sex, age or mental or physical disability.”³⁶

While language may be a ground for discrimination that the law addresses in the section 15(1), as Metallic points out, the courts have repeatedly emphasised that language rights are not implied in this same section.³⁷ However, this is not the only part of the 1982 Constitution that is not explicit about language rights. Its second part, *The Rights of the Indigenous Peoples of Canada*, is another piece of legislation in which the term “right” is covered with a thick veil. Section 35(1) states: “The existing Indigenous and treaty rights of the Indigenous peoples of Canada are hereby recognized and affirmed.”³⁸

In this regard, the trap of obscure rights is once again being played out, exacerbated by the fact that to date, no decision has been issued that would clarify whether indigenous rights also include a language aspect. The fact that since 1982 nothing has been specified

³⁴ Metallic Naomi, “Language Rights of Aboriginal Peoples”. In *Les droits linguistiques au Canada*, eds. Michel Bastarache and Michel Doucet (Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013. Metallic, 2013), 897.

³⁵ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 902.

³⁶ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 908–910.

³⁷ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 911.

³⁸ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 914.

in the law shows the seriousness of the language issue and the current situation of indigenous languages in Canada. However, there was hope for Indigenous people when a federal law, the Canadian Multiculturalism Maintenance and Enhancement Act, was passed in 1988. Although it offered no guarantees for the promotion and revitalization of Indigenous languages, which it equated with Canada's linguistic heritage as non-official languages, it did affirm a desire to enhance the status of other languages and to facilitate their acquisition, given that they also constitute the multicultural heritage of Canada.³⁹ Shortly thereafter, in 1990, Parliament passed another multiculturalism act, the Act to Establish the Canadian Heritage Languages Institute, which committed to facilitate, throughout the country, the acquisition and retention of language skills in each of the heritage languages, as well as the use of those languages.

Together, these two laws mark the beginning of legal recognition even though it is still in its early stages and these laws have little judicial power to protect indigenous languages from extinction.

Nevertheless, there are other steps that give hope for the future; among the most recent ones taken in support of Indigenous languages are the proclamation of 2019 as the "International Year of Indigenous Languages" and the passage of the Indigenous Languages Act, which provides language rights to Indigenous peoples and aims to reclaim, revitalize, maintain, and strengthen Indigenous languages in Canada.⁴⁰ This legislation also marks a major step in reconciliation with the original inhabitants and emphasizes that Indigenous languages are part of Canada's diversity and contribute to the richness of Canada's linguistic and cultural heritages. At the same time, it does not provide the means to defend these rights, nor does it bring Indigenous languages up to the level of official languages of Canada. It should be noted parenthetically that while the proclamation of all indigenous languages as official languages would seem to be an ideal solution, it would not solve the language problem, but rather aggravate it. Therefore, it is not the proclamation of indigenous languages as official languages that should be pressed, but the recognition of the linguistic rights of each indigenous community.

In addition, to study the current linguistic situation of the Canadian provinces from a legal point of view, it is important to note that, apart from Inuit of Nunavut and the indigenous languages with official status in the Northwest Territories (Chippewyan, Cree, Kutchin, Inuinnaqtun, Inuktitut, Inuvialuktun, North Slavey Language, South Slavey Language and Tlicho), the other Indigenous languages have minimal legislative rights. However, Quebec's situation is exemplary among other Canadian provinces in that it was

³⁹ Leclerc, *La politique des langues*.

⁴⁰ Leclerc, *La politique des langues*.

the first province to negotiate with the federal government on the claims of indigenous peoples and already in 1989, in the Maintenance and Development of Indigenous Languages in Quebec, it confirmed the recognition of indigenous languages and provided for measures to safeguard them.⁴¹

Furthermore, the Cree, Inuit and Naskapi living in the province of Quebec are also granted the rights in terms of education which is under indigenous control set out in section 88 of the Charter of the French Language, but also in the Education Act for the Cree, Inuit and Naskapi indigenous people and in the James Bay Agreement.⁴² It is thus evident that not necessarily all Canadian provinces realize the extent of the current language situation and provinces, such as Prince Edward Island and New Brunswick, have done very little to date for the preservation of Indigenous languages.⁴³

International laws expanding the linguistic rights of indigenous peoples

Two ideas most often emerge when it comes to international laws: first, the idea that international laws bring the weight of global issues to bear (for example, the survival of indigenous languages); second, that they challenge the severity of nationally adapted laws to deal with the problem and highlight their limitations in protecting indigenous languages. In fact, the second assumption should not necessarily reflect reality, but it is true that international agreements, covenants, and laws do exert pressure on states and governments, as they have a specific scope, and their implementation receives much attention worldwide. In this section, without providing an exhaustive list of international laws related to linguistic rights, and without mentioning other legislation dedicated to Europe (e.g., the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages), three international laws shall be highlighted, as they seem most significant for Canada.

First, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) which was adopted by the United Nations General Assembly on December 16, 1966. Canada acceded to the Covenant on May 19, 1976, the same year that the legislation came into force. The Covenant focuses on areas where positive measures should be taken to protect the existence of minorities, to guarantee them equal rights and political participation and to protect them from torture and other forms of discrimination. However, the law only mentions linguistic rights in Article 27: “In states where, there are ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities, persons belonging to these minorities may not be deprived of the

⁴¹ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 976–977.

⁴² Metallic, “Language Rights,” 981–987.

⁴³ Metallic, “Language Rights,” 991.

right to have, in common with other members of their group, their own cultural life, to profess and practice their own religion, or to use their own language.”⁴⁴ This section of the law was born out of the reluctance of some states to guarantee minority rights, but only recognizes the rights of persons belonging to minority groups, not the minorities themselves. Moreover, it has not led to concrete action by Canadian governments. This is evident in one of the reports prepared by Canada in 2013 covering the period from 2005 to 2013 to inform the United Nations Convention on the measures it has taken, and the progress made during the period under review. Indeed, the fact that only three paragraphs in the report were devoted to the issue of preservation and promotion of Indigenous languages and cultures is a clear indication. The report points out that Canada spends \$16 million on Indigenous languages (for project implementation and reconnecting communities to their cultural heritage), but at the same time mentions shortcomings, for example, those related to the implementation of recommendations of the Working Group on Indigenous Languages and Cultures.⁴⁵ This example illustrates that without governmental and federal assistance, international laws themselves may not guarantee the protection of minority languages.

Second, the 1992 United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities can be seen in a certain sense as complementing article 27 of the ICCPR: on the one hand, because it refers to minorities themselves rather than to persons belonging to minority groups; on the other hand, because it creates in Article 2 the obligation for States to protect the existence and identity of minorities and to take concrete measures to promote this identity and to guarantee the possibility for indigenous people to learn their mother tongue or to receive instruction in their mother tongue: “Persons belonging to national or ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities (hereinafter referred to as persons belonging to minorities) have the right to enjoy their own culture, to profess and practice their own religion and to use their own language, in private and in public, freely and without interference or discrimination of any kind.”⁴⁶ Despite the Declaration being constructive legislation, it has its own limitations in the escape clauses in which it leaves to States “the discretion” to determine what is “appropriate” or “possible” in the development of minority rights.

⁴⁴ Ravon, and Dubois, “Les droits linguistiques,” 153.

⁴⁵ Human Rights Program. *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights: Canada's Sixth Report covering the period January 2005 to December 2009* (2013): 15–16. https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/pch/documents/services/canada-United-nations-system/reports-united-nations-treaties/intnl_civil_politique-intnl_civil_politique-fra.pdf, accessed July 27, 2022.

⁴⁶ Ravon, and Dubois, “Les droits linguistiques,” 160.

Finally, the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People, adopted in 2007 by the United Nations Assembly, is one of the best-known international instruments. It is important to note that at that time, Canada refused to sign the declaration with 3 other countries, Australia, New Zealand, and the United States (the countries most concerned by the language issue). It was in 2010 that Canada finally approved it, but it was not until 2016 that the Minister of Indigenous and Northern Affairs Canada announced that the country fully supported the declaration. In particular, the General Assembly affirms in the Annex the equality of indigenous peoples with all other peoples and the diversity with which they enrich civilizations that constitute “the common heritage of humankind.”⁴⁷ Furthermore, the declaration contains numerous articles relating to the maintenance of indigenous culture (articles 5, 8), the revival of cultural traditions and customs (article 11) and the recognition and respect of intrinsic rights (articles 26, 37). Among them, two articles are particularly important from a linguistic point of view: Article 13 (establishing “the right to revive, use, develop and transmit to future generations their histories, languages, oral traditions, philosophy, writing systems and literature...”) and Article 31⁴⁸ (guaranteeing “the right to preserve, control, protect and develop their cultural heritage”).

However, even today, the role of this declaration is much contested by indigenous peoples who claim that the federal government does not have a clear plan to implement the provisions of the legislation. This criticism is not only directed at the UN Declaration, but in general at all legislation aimed at securing language rights for indigenous peoples. In essence, it is difficult to make laws that take into consideration the interests of all people and sometimes even the notion of “right” raises many issues. In fact, one must realize that the solution is not necessarily to be found in the use of international laws, because although they often seem promising, their enforcement is as difficult as that of constitutional or federal laws.

Attempts to revitalize Canada’s Indigenous languages

Today, there is still a long way to go to ensure the language rights of Indigenous peoples and the vitality of their languages in a legal manner. Since laws do not provide reasonable assurance against language extinction, it is essential to act in other ways to protect endan-

⁴⁷ United Nations, *Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* (2007), 2. https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/wp-content/uploads/sites/19/2018/11/UNDRIP_F_web.pdf, accessed August 30, 2022.

⁴⁸ United Nations, *Declaration on the Rights*, 12–13, 22–23.

gered indigenous languages, revitalize them and thus maintain the linguistic plurality of the world.

There are broad revitalization methods such as the establishment of cultural institutes that can achieve the goals defined by the Indigenous community. For example, the Avataq Cultural Institute in Nunavik is dedicated to the promotion of the Inuit language and among other things, engages in the collection and formalization of Inuit place names that have long been replaced by English words.⁴⁹ The other method often used is the “*Amerindianisation*” of education in which the learning of Indigenous languages is incorporated into the primary school curriculum by devoting one or two hours per week to ancestral languages. Introducing writing to traditionally oral languages is another possibility, although it is much debated, as it is questioned whether writing is a useful means against language extinction and whether the survival of languages really depends on the existence of the writing system.

Other methods of revitalization include linguistic documentation, a useful tool for the preservation and conservation of indigenous languages. It involves the description of the grammatical system and the study of the language practices of a community to establish a linguistic corpus. Documentation is enormously laborious, because it involves recording, digitalizing, and analyzing data and disseminating them in the form of linguistic reference tools such as dictionaries, grammars, and specialized vocabularies. One evidence of this documentation is the archive of the Mohawk language available on the Berkeley Linguistic Archives website or the archive of Innu audio stories and their transcriptions on the Innu-Aimun website.⁵⁰ Other example of linguistic documentation is the *Dictionnaire montagnais-français* (1991) by Lynn Drapeau, a pioneer in the field of morphological and lexicological study of the Innu language that led to the standardization of the writing or *The Metallic Mìgmaq-English Reference Dictionary* (2005), the result of a collaboration between Emmanuel Metallic, Danielle Cyr and Alexandre Sévigny. The particularity of this reference dictionary is that it presents the keywords in mìgmaq, with the definition in English, but from a mìgmaq perspective.⁵¹

It is also important to acknowledge that the media, including radio, television, print and multimedia, can also contribute to the promotion of Indigenous languages and the preservation of Indigenous identity. Programs on APTN,⁵² the world’s first national

⁴⁹ Drapeau, *Les langues autochtones*, 21–37.

⁵⁰ Drapeau, *Les langues autochtones*, 197–215.

⁵¹ Metallic Emmanuel, Danielle E. Cyr et Alexandre Sévigny, *The Metallic Mìgmaq-English Reference Dictionary* (Québec: Les Presses de l’Université Laval, 2005), 7.

⁵² APTN: Aboriginal Peoples Television Network.

Indigenous television network, “are made by, for, and about Indigenous people” to show ancient rituals, culture, and way of life.⁵³ In addition, some of the channel’s educational programs such as *Tansi! Nehiyawetan: Let’s Speak Cree!* are specifically geared towards children learning languages,⁵⁴ which thus contribute to the preservation of ancestral languages.

Finally, two concrete revitalization attempts carried out in collaboration with the Native American community are also worth mentioning. One of the revitalized languages is the *Migmaq* language in *Listuguj*, which has been in a critical state since 1970 when it became more common that the inhabitants did not pass on the language to future generations. However, the problem is largely due to the borrowed curricula of the French language that were not adopted to the linguistic reality of the *Migmaq* language and even adapted the sentence structures of Indo-European languages (subject + verb + object complement) to create *Migmaq* sentences.⁵⁵ The approach developed by Mary Ann Metallic and Janice Vicaire, teachers of the *Migmaq* language, involves a series of engaging images and is based on the same principle as learning the mother tongue. Following birth, no one knows how to speak, but we learn the names of things around us after repetition. Therefore, teachers realized that the same method involving series of pictures (representing nouns, animals, clothes, nature, etc.) can be effectively used, stimulating visual learning quickly in learners.⁵⁶ The method has been a huge success and an unprecedented number of local people who previously had no knowledge of the language has begun to use it successfully.

The other language, Huron-Wendat, which had not been spoken for decades, is also reconstructed from archival data from the 17th and 18th centuries and is a living proof that the lack of speakers is not an obstacle to revitalization. Today, about 3,000 Wendat live in the village of Wendake on the northern outskirts of Quebec City, while the rest live dispersed in other cities in Canada and the United States. Prior to the 2000s, most of the population did not speak their ancestral language but spoke French as their mother tongue⁵⁷ and because of their long history of cohabitation and interbreeding with the

⁵³ Takam Alain Flaubert, “Revitalisation des langues minoritaires par les médias : Étude de quelques stratégies de promotion des langues autochtones au Canada,” *Linguistica Atlantica*, no. 36(2), (2017): 117.

⁵⁴ Takam, “Revitalisation des langues,” 118.

⁵⁵ Drapeau, *Les langues autochtones*, 92–94.

⁵⁶ Sarkar Mela, Janine Metallic, Mary Ann Metallic and Janice Vicaire, “Listuguj nemitueg tli’suti napui’gnigtug: Learning Mi’gmaq as an adult in Listuguj,” In *Les langues autochtones du Québec: Un patrimoine en danger*, ed. Lynn Drapeau (Montreal: Presses de l’Université du Québec, 2011), 94–101.

⁵⁷ Sarkar, Janine, Mary Ann and Janice, “Listuguj nemitueg tli’suti,” 48–49.

dominant population, their physical appearance was also indistinguishable from that of the White People. Despite their biological miscegenation and gradual (socio-economic) integration into the dominant society, which also threatened their own language, they preserved part of their unique identity, which they tried to emphasize from the 2000s onwards, for example, with the Yawenda (“The Voice”) project, which began in 2007. The goal of this project was to reconstruct the Huron-Wendat language (rebuilding nominal roots, verbal morphology, and grammar) from archival data of the 17th and 18th centuries, to which a great number of treatises and dictionaries date back thanks to the exhaustive study of the language by Recollect and Jesuit missionaries (Sagard’s *Dictionnaire de la langue huronne*, 1632; *Racines huronnes* by Étienne de Carheil, 1666; *Elementa grammaticae huronicae* by Pierre Potier, 1745).⁵⁸ However, it also shows us that the number of written sources could not protect the language from disappearing.

It is clear from what we have seen that the revitalization of a language is not an impossible mission. There are many ways to do it and neither the number of existing written resources nor the number of current speakers present an obstacle to the preservation of a language. Everyone is born into a culture independent of his/her choice. Thus, although no one can choose the mother tongue he/she would like to speak, we have the choice to protect and maintain it as well as to consider this inherent cultural heritage, as our own intangible heritage. Despite the history and tragedy survived by millions of indigenous people in residential schools or in welfare systems have had a big impact on the current situation of indigenous languages and cultures, and that it is difficult today for many people to face and overcome the identity crisis the effects of which they still suffer from, many people are unable to see their culture and mother tongue as their own, which is not helped either by the reluctance of governments to recognize the cultural heritage of indigenous people and consider their presence in society as enriching and part of Canadian multiculturalism.

⁵⁸ Sarkar, Janine, Mary Ann and Janice, “Listugujg nemitueg tli’suti,” 110–114.

References

- Alain Flaubert, Takam. « Revitalisation des langues minoritaires par les médias : Étude de quelques stratégies de promotion des langues autochtones au Canada, » *Linguistica Atlantica*, no. 36(2), (2017).
- Dion, Jacinthe, Hains Jennifer, Ross Amélie, and Delphine Collin-Vézina, “Residential Schools: Intergenerational Impacts,” *Enfances Familles Générations*, vol. 25 (2016): 2. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1039497ar>.
- Emmanuel, Metallic, Danielle E. Cyr et Alexandre Sévigny. *The Metallic Māq-English Reference Dictionary*. Québec: Les Presses de l’Université Laval, 2005.
- Henry Vivian, Nelles. *A Brief History of Canada*. Montreal: Fides, 2005.
- Human Rights Program. *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights: Canada’s Sixth Report covering the period January 2005 to December 2009*. 2013. https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/pch/documents/services/canada-united-nations-system/reports-united-nations-treaties/intnl_civil_politique-intnl_civil_political-fra.pdf, accessed July 27, 2022.
- Jacques, Leclerc. *La politique des langues officielles du gouvernement fédéral*. Québec : L’aménagement linguistique dans le monde, 2019. <https://www.axl.céfan.ulaval.ca/monde/>, accessed September 03, 2022.
- Jacques, Leclerc. *Les droits linguistiques des autochtones*. Québec : l’Aménagement linguistique dans le monde, 2015. http://www.axl.céfan.ulaval.ca/amnord/Quebec-8Autochtones-droits_lng.htm, accessed September 04, 2022.
- Jacques, Maurais, *Les langues autochtones du Québec* (Québec: Les Publications du Québec, 1992).
- Louis-Jacques, Dorais, « Les langues autochtones d’hier à aujourd’hui ». In *Les langues autochtones du Québec*, edited by Jacques Maurais. Québec: Les Publications du Québec, 1992.
- Lynn, Drapeau. *Les langues autochtones du Québec: un patrimoine en danger*. Québec: Presses de l’Université du Québec, 2011.
- Marguerite, Mackenzie, and Julie Brittain. *Translation as a way to save Indigenous languages*. Circuit, no. 139, 2019. <https://www.circuitmagazine.org/dossiers-139/translation-as-a-way-to-save-indigenous-languages>, accessed July 29, 2022.

Mela, Sarkar, Janine Metallic, Mary Ann Metallic and Janice Vicaire. “Listugujg nemitueg tli’suti napui’gnigtug: Learning Mi’gmaq as an adult in Listuguj”. In *Les langues autochtones du Québec : Un patrimoine en danger*, edited by Lynn Drapeau. Montreal: Presses de l’Université du Québec, 2011.

Michel, Bastarache et al. *Les droits linguistiques*. Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013.

Naiomi, Metallic. “Language Rights of Aboriginal Peoples.” In *Les droits linguistiques au Canada*, edited by Michel Bastarache and Michel Doucet. Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013.

Olive, Dickason. *The First Nations of Canada*. St. Laurent: Les éditions du Septentrion, 1996.

Perri, Ravon, and Dubois Justin. « Les droits linguistiques en droit international. » In *Les droits linguistiques au Canada*, edited by Michel Bastarache and Michel Doucet. Cowansville : Editions Yvon Blais, 2013.

Robert, Vézina. « Amerindians and Franco-Canadians: Une rencontre inscrite dans la langue ». *Cap-aux-Diamants*, no. 96 (2009).

Task Force on Aboriginal Languages and Cultures (TFALC), *Towards a new beginning: a foundational report for a strategy to revitalize First Nation, Inuit and Métis languages and cultures*. Gatineau: Canadian Heritage, 2005.

Task Force on Aboriginal Languages and Cultures (TFALC). *The Beginning of a New Time: First Report Towards a Strategy for Revitalizing First Nations, Inuit and Métis Languages and Cultures*. Gatineau: Canadian Heritage, 2005.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRCC). *Honouring the Truth, Reconciling for the Future: Summary of the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2015.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRCC). *They Came for the Children: Canada, Aboriginal Peoples and Residential Schools*. 2012. <http://publications.gc.ca/site/fra/9.639663/publication.html>, accessed August 12, 2022.

United Nations. Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. 2007. https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/wp-content/uploads/sites/19/2018/11/UNDRIP_F_web.pdf, accessed August 30, 2022.

William Francis, Mackey. *Prolegomènes à l'analyse de la dynamique des langues*. DiversCité Langues, 2000. <https://www.telug.quebec.ca/diverscite/SecArtic/Arts/2000/mackey/ftxt.htm>, accessed September 8, 2021.

ESZTER ZSUZSANNA CSORBA

The Everlasting Effect of Richard Nixon

Pro&Contra 5

No. 2 (2021) 81–97

<https://doi.org/10.33033/pc.2021.2.81>

Abstract

Since his resignation almost fifty years ago, President Richard M. Nixon's name has been weaved through the fabric of history thanks to popular culture: books, biographies, films, from comedy to historical fiction, with documentaries, TV shows, cartoons and even comic books. More famous, and the scandal that popular culture mostly re-adapts, the Watergate Scandal, which ensured a distrust in the political system of the United States, a divide still present in the relationship of the public and its elected officials. Young generations of scholars have encountered Nixon's name through popular culture over and over, and are much more likely to learn about his turbulent political career from parodies and satires sooner than from history books. The paper does not to dispute the wrongdoings of this formidable character but showcases how Nixon's name is embedded in public discussion thanks to the iconography of his character, his voice, the strong jawline, the unique nose, and speeches delivered by the former President, his action in and outside of the office, as well as his unique relationship with the media—a relationship which is evolving with each new President in the White House.

Key Words: Popular Culture, United States presidents, history, Richard Nixon, John F. Kennedy

Vincent Vega (played by John Travolta) in Quentin Tarantino's *Pulp Fiction* (1994) is tasked with looking after his boss' wife, Mia Wallace (played by Uma Thurman). The two go to a fictional restaurant by the name of Jackrabbit Slim's, where their host, among a long list of celebrity impersonators that make up the staff of the restaurant, is an older gentleman, wearing a simple grey suit, and a brushed back dark hair.¹ His arms always folded in front of him, he is never named by either character, but his mannerisms cannot be mistaken: this is Richard Nixon himself. The grey of his suit is not the color of Nixon's real suit, but the color which it appeared to have through the black and white television sets of the American people during the first televised Presidential debate between him and Democratic candidate John F. Kennedy.² In a final scene, the host returns to announce a twist competition in the restaurant, with a Marilyn Monroe impersonator by his side,³ the actress who famously had an affair with President Kennedy. A small scene, but striking to

¹ *Pulp Fiction*, Dir. Quentin Tarantino, Perf. John Travolta, Bruce Willis and Uma Thurman, Miramax, 1994, DVD.

² CBS, "TNC:172 Kennedy-Nixon First Presidential Debate, 1960." Youtube video, www.youtube.be/gbrckqLSRw.

³ *Pulp Fiction*, *ibid*.

those who recognize the historical significance of reducing Richard Nixon to the role of a waiter, among Hollywood's walk-of-fame characters in an American diner-like burger restaurant.

When talking about the presence that Nixon still possesses, one has to look at the ways the President has been portrayed or quoted since he resigned from the Oval Office. What could not be foreseen at the time would be the everlasting effect that Richard Nixon would have in political and popular culture for the years to come. From his time as a vice-Presidential candidate speaking to American voters about his financial situation, to being part of the first televised presidential debate, all the way down to his interview with David Frost, the media had a hand in shaping history. Like many presidents before and after him, Nixon too cemented himself in the world of popular culture, but not as a hero, more of a parody of himself. The scene in *Pulp Fiction* is one of countless that have brought back the iconography of Richard Nixon, and the aim of this paper is to detail the many ways in which popular culture has gotten a hold of the iconic voice, the strong jawline, the unique nose, as well as the mannerisms and speeches delivered by the former President, and how even in the 21st century he is an iconic character that graces both the small and big screens.

The politician, Richard M. Nixon, the 37th President of the United States, was elected twice and is still the only President to leave his post after a resignation. He was a man who fought long and hard to get into the Oval Office and was on the headlines of both the printed press and television news over several years. Thus, when discussing media history, one is bound to bump into Richard Nixon at some of the biggest milestones. Although it was not until 1968 that he got the presidential seat, his political career had begun far sooner, and his presence in mainstream media helped him to become an expert of the press, but not an expert of presenting himself according to the press' wishes. This was something he had to learn from his opponent John F. Kennedy, who "set out to become the first movie-star politician."⁴ The idea of a White House open to the press was something the Kennedy administration perfected, and all other Presidents after him had to have their battles with the media, as there would be no way of closing the doors to the private life of the first family again. Unlike Nixon, who had already resided in the White House as vice-President to Dwight D. Eisenhower, between the years of 1953-1961, Kennedy was indeed very "attentive to the press."⁵ He made covering the campaign as easy

⁴ John A. Barnes, *John F. Kennedy on Leadership: the Lessons and Legacy of a President* (American Mgmt, 2005), 51.

⁵ Barbie Zelizer, *Covering the body: The Kennedy Assassination, the Media, and the Shaping of Collective Memory* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 20.

as possible, by handing out transcripts of his speeches just minutes after they were made. By cutting back on research and fact-checking, the life of the press was made a lot easier.⁶ This was a practice that the press looked for in every candidate afterwards, and also one of the reasons Nixon disliked them so much.

Being the only President to ever resign from the Oval Office, he already made history. Still, this portrayal in all of these movies and TV shows point to one thing: his failure. As this paper has discussed thoroughly, Nixon was a very active politician, and even though the media reported on it constantly, it seems that his shortcomings overshadowed many of his political successes in his lifetime. The young Richard, eventually the running mate of Dwight D. Eisenhower, was a Senator from California who had experience as a politician but was not a leading man. Nixon was previously a congressman for California between 1947 and 1950, after which he became a senator, a position he later resigned from purposefully to run for the vice-Presidential seat. He became known for the indictment of Alger Hiss, a State Department official whom Nixon was determined to expose as a Communist.⁷ The case was covered thoroughly by the press and as Nixon became more famous around the country, he also advanced in his political career. Nixon's rise to power was jumpstarted by his presence on the Republican ticket, and despite his active years as a successful politician, being a representative or a senator alone would not have moved him ahead. His use of the media for manipulation and campaigning was more visible once he was in office. He was a good choice for second in command, but he had not become the right candidate for the presidency until his battle against vice-President Hubert Humphrey in 1968. When it comes to Nixon, the entirety of his time in the White House, including when he held the vice-Presidential seat, is referenced or parodied in popular culture, even though his resignation is considered to be the most important moment in his career.

Before diving into the several facets of popular culture in which Richard Nixon was featured, it has to be mentioned that there are hundreds of films set in the 70s that feature Nixon through archival footage of his television appearances. In these the main characters either refer to his words, or the footage is used to highlight the period in which the story takes place. When looking at these films, there are also two kinds: movies that had an actor portray the late President, and the ones that used or remade archival footage for the story. The first movie to be discussed was written and directed by Olive Stone, entitled promptly Nixon (1995). It is one of four movies that feature the President's name

⁶ Ibid, 20-1.

⁷ Deb Riechmann, "Nixon Urged Hiss Indictment," last modified October 13, 1999, www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/politics/feed/a52881-1999oct13.htm.

in their title, and that will be discussed in the paper, the other three *being* *The Assassination of Richard Nixon* (2004), which only used archival footage; *Frost/Nixon* (2008); and finally, *Dick* (1999), which was a nickname which became famous following his actions to remain in power, and the movie plays with the ambiguity of the word.

This first film, directed by Stone, received mix reviews, as its aim was to focus on the feelings of Nixon (played by Anthony Hopkins) about how the lies that he and his administration were keeping were eating at him, resulting in continuous conflict between him and his wife Pat Nixon (played by Joan Allen). The three-hour movie starts from Nixon's first run for office against John F. Kennedy, and ends with his resignation. The movie also aims to showcase the hardships of campaigning, as well as the weight of being president. It is a truly touching movie, and it rebuilds famous footage of Nixon, as well as uses the tapes that ended up incriminating the President and his staff.⁸ Director Oliver Stone has often been criticized for his depiction of Presidents in several of his movies. However, unlike the other examples in this paper, the audience knows exactly what to expect when seeing a film entitled "Nixon." What makes the former President an iconic figure is that since his resignation in 1974, he has become a somewhat of a non-playable character, who appears in the least expected stories, many times not having anything to do with his political career. This paper urges the readers to see this movie and to read up on the criticism that follows it, as it is highly educational and a great representation of a difficult time in US history.

The Assassination of Richard Nixon (1994) is the true story of Sam Bicke⁹, who wished to divert a passenger plane and crash it into the White House in hopes of killing Nixon. He was stopped at the airport; however, he believed that he would be thought of as a hero, as his frustration with a dishonest and racist America led him to desperation, and he believed that Nixon was the biggest conman of them all. This movie only used archival footage of Nixon's speeches held at the White House, and voiceover of the tapes Bicke made of his plans. The story the movie was based on took place in 1972, when Nixon was re-elected, and was followed by his resignation in 1974.

In the past fifty years, the resigned President has become somewhat of an icon. Him smiling and doing the victory or peace sign with both hands in the air—a pose he performed both when he won the election for the first time, as well as when he left the White House for the last time, before entering Marine One -, is so ubiquitous that it was featured in the movie *Point Break* (1991). In the movie bank robbers wore presidential masks, and the one who got Nixon, before exiting the bank looked back at the hostages,

⁸ *Nixon*, Dir. Oliver Stone, Perf. Anthony Hopkins, Cinergi Pictures Entertainment, 1995, DVD.

⁹ Originally Samuel Byck, but changed for the movie.

raised his hand in victory and, imitating Nixon's voice, said "I'm not a crook."¹⁰ Nixon included this sentence in a speech about figures and earnings only to end in the positive note that reinforced how he was only serving the American people: "[They] have got to know whether or not their President is a crook," and he then uttered the most famous line of his whole political career "Well, I am not a crook."¹¹

Another movie quoting these iconic lines was *Contact* (1997), in which the opening scene zooms out from Earth and we listen to transmissions on a satellite orbiting. Among famous lines from other Cold War presidents, one can easily make out the voice of Nixon emphasizing that he is not, indeed, a crook.¹² Another radio transmission can be heard in *The Rocky Horror Picture Show* (1975): as Brad and Janet get lost in the rain in the night, from the radio the audience can make out clearly the (by 1976 famous) resignation speech of the President, aired back in 1974, and it is this transmission that actually dates the story of the film for the viewer.¹³

In the mini-series *11.22.63* (2016) the main character travels back in time to 1960 where a tailor simply tells him "When I vote, it comes down to character. Richard Nixon has it. You look at him, you think that's a good man,"¹⁴ and as the protagonist already knows about the Watergate scandal he just smiles awkwardly. This was not the only example of a main character encountering either the phenomenon or the man himself through time travel. Nixon appeared at the beginning of his presidency in the British series *Doctor Who* (2005-), where the protagonist, the Doctor, was trying to save a little girl who called the Oval Office over and over again looking for help. At the end of their adventure Nixon approaches the Doctor and asks him if he will be remembered, to which the reply is "Oh Dicky. Tricky Dicky. They are never going to forget you."¹⁵ He is already referencing some of the nicknames Nixon received during his life in office, prior and during the presidency.

¹⁰ *Point Break*, Dir. Kathryn Bigelow, Perf. Keanu Reeves and Patrick Swayze, Largo Entertainment, 1991, Videocassette.

¹¹ Carroll Kilpatrick, "Nixon Tells Editors, 'I'm Not a Crook,'" last modified October 13, 2016, www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/national/longterm/watergate/articles/111873-1.htm.

¹² *Contact*, Dir. Robert Zemeckis, Perf. Jodie Foster and Matthew McConaughey, Warner Bros., 1997, DVD.

¹³ *The Rocky Horror Picture Show*, Dir. Jim Sharman, Perf. Tim Curry, Susan Sarandon and Barry Bostwick, Twentieth Century Fox, 1975, DVD.

¹⁴ *11.22.63*, season 1, episode 1, "The Rabbit Hole," directed by Kevin Macdonald, written by Bridget Carpenter, aired February 15, 2016.

¹⁵ *Doctor Who*, season 6, episode 2, "Day of the Moon," directed by Toby Haynes and Julian Simpson, written by Stephen Moffat, aired April 30, 2011. BBC.

Although it is an entertaining notion to take a story to the past through time travel, and even perhaps alter the outcome of history, most movies that look at the 37th President were made in the genre of historical fiction, among them the award-winning *Forrest Gump* (1994), where the main character, Forrest, being at the Watergate Hotel as a guest of the President, sees men with flashlights in another room. He believes that they are looking for a fuse box, so he calls it in to get them help, when in actuality those were the men who broke into the Democratic office in order to bug it.¹⁶ Another film of comedic nature entitled *Dick* (1999), solely devoted to Nixon's last years in office, is about two teenage girls who befriend the President. The whole purpose of the movie is to rewrite history, in a way to make it seem that Dick Nixon made foreign and national political decision due to his friendship with the two main characters. One of them lived at the Watergate complex and because of that the White House keeps a closer eye on them. They walk his dog Checkers, they ask him to end the war, they teach him the iconic victory sign, which he learns to be a peace sign, as well as influence those people in his staff who decided to resign before the truth about the scandal was finally revealed.¹⁷

It has been proven popular to take history and add new characters to it: besides the comedic effect, it also encompasses an educative aim, as the insertion of a character through whom the audience can witness history is a great way to understand how and why certain events unfolded the way they did. Today a large majority of television audience might only hear about Richard Nixon because they encounter him in a movie or a TV show. A great example of a joke in a movie for kids but aimed at an older audience was the animated film *Minions*, released in 2015, where we can see a campaign poster from 1968 with Nixon on it, hands in the air doing the peace sign, and the slogan reading "Finally a name you can TRUST!"¹⁸ It was a children's movie which included several jokes from the sixties that probably brought up a lot of questions that only the adults could answer, Nixon being the sign of trust is one of them. Even if the evil henchmen that are the *Minions*, did not help with his election, there was one TV series which believed that his rise to power was aided by outside forces. In an episode of *The X Files* (1993-2018) series Nixon is seen with a genie who can grant him three wishes. The detectives find a pattern for the mysterious appearance of the genie and conclude that Nixon was a man "who got all the

¹⁶ *Forrest Gump*, Dir. Robert Zemeckis, Perf. Tom Hanks, Robin Wright, Gary Sinise, Sally Field, and Mykelti Williamson, Paramount Pictures, 1994, DVD.

¹⁷ *Dick*, Dir. Andrew Flemming, Perf. Michelle Williams, Kirsten Dunst and Dan Hedaya, Canal+ Droits Audiovisuels, 1999, DVD.

¹⁸ *Minions*. Dir. Kyle Balda and Pierre Coffin. Dreamworks, 2015. DVD.

power he ever wished for and then lost it,”¹⁹ alluding to the idea that he really wished for more than he could handle, thus bringing about his own destruction. Both of these examples featured nothing more than an image of the former President, but that is further proof of how Nixon’s fame precedes him, and that neither a movie nor a TV show needs to detail the history of his time in office in order build on it.

Comic books are wonderful examples of how superheroes can be added to historical events and be made active participants. Richard Nixon appeared in the comic book and then the movie adaptation of *X-Men: Days of Future Past* (2014). In it the people are afraid of mutants, afraid of everything that is unknown to them, and the President is in the end saved by them.²⁰ Big comic book series, which included continuous criticism of contemporary society, in particular the X-Men series, heavily feature presidents in their plots. This series has been in print since 1963, thus adding to the rich history of comic books and graphic novels that narrate major moments in United States history. The comic book version, *Days of Future Past* was published back in 1981.²¹ That was not the only time Nixon appeared in a comic book. It is not just major companies – such as Marvel and DC comics – who decided to use him, but there was a small comic entitled *Forward with Eisenhower – Nixon* printed with the intent of helping the campaign along. Although these are almost impossible to get, some faint copies exist in museums, showing a young Richard Nixon smiling as the candidate for the vice-Presidential office. Arguably, these are not of the same caliber as those of the major distributors, but it is interesting mainly because very few Presidents used comic books in their campaigns, and at a time when television was not as widespread, it is fascinating to witness the tools with which both the Republican and the Democratic party wished to inform its possible voters for the upcoming election season.

When it comes to political satire there is one show that has to be mentioned, as it did not only cash in on the fame of the former President, but decided to resurrect him: *Futurama* (1999-2014), by creator Matt Groening. According to the show, taking place in the year 3000, people’s heads can be preserved and given eternal life, and as such the show kept bringing back historical figures. Richard Nixon is first introduced in a museum, in the Hall of Presidents, and remains a returning character in the series, as he becomes the President once more in a story line that aims to parody voter turnout in election season

¹⁹ *The X-Files*, season seven, episode 21, “Je Souhaite,” directed by Vince Gilligan, written by Chris Carter, aired May 14, 2000.

²⁰ *X-Men: Days of Future Past*, Dir. Bryan Singer, Perf. Hugh Jackman and Jennifer Lawrence, Twentieth Century Fox Home Entertainment, 2014, DVD.

²¹ Chris Claremont and John Byrne, *X-Men #138–141*, *The Uncanny X-Men #142–143*, Marvel Comics. January, 1981.

in the United States. In one episode Nixon decides to campaign to become President of Earth. Among the many hints at actual historical events, first the protagonists of the show make recordings of him, a call back to his recordings in the Oval Office. Second, Nixon gives a speech about how he is going to keep the robot body that helps him move around, referencing the *Checkers speech*,²² made during his campaign to stay as the candidate for the vice-presidency, “I paid for this body and I would no sooner return it than I would my cocker-spaniel dog Checkers”.²³ In the cartoon Nixon still wins the elections because he is the only one who goes to vote. Nixon’s head then receives a body, no other than that of Spiro Agnew, his former vice-President, who had resigned just before the President did, amidst the Watergate Scandal. A small but significant detail, as a vice-President literally made up the body of the President, and thus allowed the bodyless head to perform his famous victory sign once again. In another episode which parodies the Vietnam War - even playing the title song of the famous show *M*A*S*H* (1972–1983) - there is one scene where Nixon says “I want this robot fixed. Fixed like Kennedy fixed the 1960’s election,”²⁴ which was a reference to the results which were brought into question at the time. Kennedy’s victory was within the margin of error and many believed that Nixon was cheated out of getting the presidency. There was an article written by Richard Wilson, a veteran Washington correspondent and columnist, entitled “How to Steal an Election,” highlighting how close the numbers were. After the article got published Nixon himself called for Wilson and told him fair and square that the presidency cannot be stolen.²⁵ The *Futurama* series always portrayed the President as somewhat of an aggressive type and although records show that Nixon let go of his loss to Kennedy, maybe that was not true considering his nature. Nixon’s character was featured in sixteen episodes, as he was elected president of the universe in the year 3000, and out of those episodes over a half has one-liners referencing his political career.

During his lifetime, President Nixon wrote six books that were published after his time in office ended, among them *The Memoirs of Richard Nixon* (1978), as well as a revised and more personal biography entitled *In the Arena: A Memoir of Victory, Defeat, and Renewal*

²² Richard Nixon, “Checkers Speech,” September 23, 1952, television broadcast, *Media Services*.

²³ *Futurama*, season 2, episode 7, “A Head in the Polls,” directed by Bret Haaland, written by Matt Groening, aired December 12, 1999.

²⁴ *Futurama*, season 3, episode 2, “Was Is the H-Word,” directed by Ron Hughart, written by Matt Groening, aired November 26, 2000.

²⁵ Gary Allen, *Richard Nixon: The Man Behind the Mask* (Western Islands, Boston–Los Angeles, 1971), 121.

(1990).²⁶ The Watergate affair reached beyond the sea and the reason for his resignation was clear to everyone, although the flow of information, even that of popular culture, was limited in the Cold War era. It was not uncommon to add the word “gate” to end of words to signify a political scandal. And although that disgrace tinted his name, the former President could not disappear from public eye. As far as popular culture is concerned, Nixon’s character has appeared in both historical fiction as well as satire, the latter emphasizing all those negative connotations that come with how he was forced to resign the presidency and his confession to David Frost.²⁷

It is hard to find any movies or true story adaptations that detail his successes as vice-President. Although Nixon was not present in the media on an everyday basis, as far as domestic policy was concerned, he did become an “ambassador” for the United States and as such appeared in international news all the time. He was sent on several missions abroad in a crucial era of the Cold War. His diplomatic ability and standing strong during a troublesome time made him somewhat “cool” and famous on an international level.²⁸ His first trips took him to Asia, South Korea and Japan, which would give Americans the impression that he was an expert in Asian affairs. He was more of an “ambassador” sent around to deliver Eisenhower’s will. In 1956 he traveled to Europe, Austria to meet with Hungarian refugees and then a year later he traveled to Africa.²⁹ The idea of Richard Nixon as a hero back home was born after a trip to South America, from which he believed he would not return safely or that he might be killed.³⁰ During his trip he visited Peru, where people chanted “Go Home Nixon!;” in Venezuela he was spat on, leaving the military of the country as well as that of the United States to help rescue him. He arrived home to the States, where thousands of Americans gathered at the airport to welcome him, including the President, and for weeks people praised the bravery with which he faced the Venezuelan people alongside his wife Pat.³¹

Evidence points to his wrongdoing being the only thing that history left us. Not to mention that his rivalry with Kennedy has seemed to survive both of them, despite historians revealing that the two men were on good terms and respected each other a great deal

²⁶ The author of this paper is yet to find a bookstore in Hungary that sell any of President Nixon’s books, either by or about him, yet books of John F. Kennedy and his wife fill up the history sections.

²⁷ Richard Nixon, interview by David Frost, *The Watergate Interview*, CBS, May 5, 1977.

²⁸ “The Vice-president,” *The Nixon Library and Museum*, accessed August 31, 2016, www.nixonlibrary.gov/thelife/apolitician/thevicepresident.php.

²⁹ “Richard M. Nixon, 36th Vice-President (1953-1961),” *United States Senate*, accessed September 1, 2016, www.senate.gov/artandhistory/history/common/generic/VP_Richard_Nixon.htm.

³⁰ “The Vice-president,” *ibid.*

³¹ “Richard M. Nixon,” *ibid.*

as politicians. However, this rivalry has had an impact not only on political history, but also on the popular culture that tries to detail and represent it, either to showcase history or to distort it in an entertaining manner for the viewer.

There is no question about how the Watergate Scandal ensured a distrust in the political enterprise of the United States, a divide still present in the relationship of the public and its elected officials. Any and all illegal activities must come at a cost, even if Nixon did not seem to think so. In his interview with David Frost, he claimed that when the President did something it was not illegal,³² which was the sentence that fired up the conversation between them. And among the many reasons why Nixon's action should be and are still taught in classrooms is really what American democracy is based on: that one should not accept authority blindly but instead should place value on searching for facts.³³ The Constitution of the United States in its first amendment stipulates the need for free speech and free press, while the fourth amendment points out that "the right of the people to be secure in their persons, houses, papers, and effects, against unreasonable searches and seizures" cannot be violated in any way, and not just by the police but by any outsider.³⁴ The Watergate break-in was indisputably an illegal activity, and there are more examples of how one lie can stick with a politician's career for life. Perhaps the attempt of the movies listed above parodying this part of history is an attempt to heal the nation, as although the severity of the scandal cannot be overlooked, it can still be reexamined and understood in a different manner than it was at the time.

Although Nixon evaded impeachment by resigning and receiving an official pardon from President Gerald Ford, the simplest argument one can make for reusing Nixon's case is the fact that it made him relatable. When one makes a mistake, they seem more down to earth, more approachable, but Nixon never showed his personal side more than he had to. The main reason Oliver Stone's movie was so highly debated was that trying to see inside the head of this complex character seems impossible. Nixon was a very smart man and an even more skilled politician. It is not surprising that any admission of guilt for wrongdoing could be gotten out of Nixon only once he left his political career. The media was not easy on Nixon, and unfortunately for him, no matter his successes in foreign affairs, the American people have always voted based on internal affairs.³⁵

³² Richard Nixon, interview by David Frost, *War at home and abroad*, CBS, May 19, 1977.

³³ Malcolm Katz, "Classroom Implications of Watergate," *The Phi Delta Kappan* 55, no. 7 (1974): 465–67.

³⁴ "Fourth Amendment," *Legal Information Institute*, Cornell Law School, www.law.cornell.edu/constitution/fourth_amendment.

³⁵ Marion Just et al. "Leadership Image-Building: After Clinton and Watergate," *Political Psychology* 21, no. 1 (2000): 179–98.

And as far as the general population is concerned, something broke in the American people. Conspiracy theories are nothing new in the history of a country, but the fact that the White House could be behind something illegal while its mission has been to uphold the laws of the land, had been unprecedented. People were given the sense that their government was working against them. Such conspiracies would come to life with or without Nixon, as it did in the case of the assassination of John F. Kennedy, but they would not stand on such solid ground without him. The scandal brought about a threat to the democratic country that the Americans had fought so hard to establish. Before Watergate it seemed natural that governmental information should be confidential, a great example would be the Warren Report which details the death of Kennedy. After this scandal, however, common sense suggests having papers available to the public at all costs.³⁶ The aim to end this kind of secrecy over official documents can be seen as we speak, as the courts have recently ordered the release of former President Donald J. Trump's tax records; not only that, but there was considerable public interest over the report submitted by Robert Mueller and his team.³⁷ Today the courts are trying to unveil if there was any real conspiracy behind the January 6th insurrection against The Capitol in 2021, in an aim to ensure the public that justice will be done.³⁸ The disbelief in one's government is the worst thing any politician can elicit in the public, and Nixon knew very well what he had done as he said so himself to David Frost in their interview "I let down the country, I let down our system of government and the dreams of all those young people that ought to get into government but will think it is all too corrupt and the rest."³⁹ The magnitude of this interview also resonates into the 21st century, for instance by plays reenacting it. The most famous of these was written by Peter Morgan, made into a movie by Ron Howard, being then awarded Movie of the Year AFI award in 2009, as well as nominated for five Academy Awards, entitled *Frost/Nixon* (2008, *Frost/Nixon*). The movie, with Frank Langella as Richard Nixon and Michael Sheen as Australian born David Frost, focuses on the most famous part of the original interview series, where Nixon admits his wrongdoing.⁴⁰

³⁶ Richard R. Schwartz, "President's Message: After Watergate," *Law & Society Review* 8, no. 1 (1973), 3-5.

³⁷ Jan Pytalski, "Hundreds gather near White House to demand Mueller report release," last modified April 4, 2019, www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-trump-russia-demonstrations/us-rallies-scheduled-to-demand-release-of-full-mueller-report-idUSKCN1RG14Q.

³⁸ Madison Hall, et al. "702 People Have Been Charged in the Capitol Insurrection so Far. This Searchable Table Shows Them All," last modified November 22, 2021, www.insider.com/all-the-us-capitol-pro-trump-riot-arrests-charges-names-2021-1.

³⁹ Richard Nixon, interview by David Frost, *The Watergate Interview*, *ibid.*

⁴⁰ *Frost/Nixon*. Dir. Ron Howard, Universal Pictures, 2008, DVD.

The film was purposefully left as a final example in this paper: as anticipated in the paragraph on Oliver Stone's *Nixon*, its title already allures to the fact that the story is about the former President. This depicts the magnitude of one single moment in the life of former President Richard Milhous Nixon, and not the entirety of his political career. There are several moments in the career of this big politician that popular culture has chosen to deal with, but this final chapter is almost never subject to parody or satire. The complexity of the situation that arose from the Watergate scandal is one that the American audience is still dealing with, and the waves that stemmed from mistrust in the political elite is one that is felt up to this day.

Richard Nixon filmed the Checkers Speech in 1952, which means that he has been present in public discussion for seventy years. Of those who served in the White House and are prominent in popular culture, John F. Kennedy represents the loss of potential, the loss of a possible future, while Nixon is villainized and far too often the target of a joke. But since his resignation almost fifty years ago, Nixon's name has been weaved through the fabric of history thanks to popular culture: books, biographies, films, from comedy to historical fiction, with documentaries, TV shows, cartoons and even comic books. Young generations are bound to encounter the name of this famous President through popular culture over and over, instead of the history books, and that is the case for US citizens as well as a foreign audience to the United States. The aim of this paper was not to dispute the wrongdoings of this formidable character but to showcase how, perhaps some seventy years from now, Nixon's name will still be embedded in public discussion, thanks to the iconography of his character, his mannerism, his action in and outside of the office, as well as his unique relationship with the media – a relationship which is evolving with each new President in the White House.

References:

- Allen, Gary. *Richard Nixon: The Man Behind the Mask*. Western Islands, Boston–Los Angeles, 1971.
- Balda, Kyle, dir. *Minions*. Glendale, CA: Dreamworks, 2015. DVD.
- Barnes, John A. *John F. Kennedy on Leadership: the Lessons and Legacy of a President*. American Mgmt., 2005.
- Bigelow, Kathryn, dir. *Point Break*. Largo Entertainment, 1991. DVD.
- Carpenter, Bridget, and Stephen King. “The Rabbit Hole.” *11.22.63*. Dir. Kevin McDonald. Hulu. February 15, 2016. Television.
- Carter, Chris. “Je Souhaite.” *The X Files*. Dir. Vince Gilligan. Fox. April 25, 2004. Television.
- CBS. “TNC:172 Kennedy-Nixon First Presidential Debate, 1960.” Youtube, uploaded by JFK Library, September 21, 2016. www.youtube.be/gbrcRKqLSRw.
- Claremont, Chris and John Byrne. *X-Men #138–141, The Uncanny X-Men #142–143*. New York: Marvel Comics, 1981.
- Flemming, Andrew, dir. *Dick*. 1999. Whitby, Ontario, Canada: Canal+ Droits Audiovisuels 2002. DVD.
- “Fourth Amendment.” *Legal Information Institute*. Cornell Law School, www.law.cornell.edu/constitution/fourth_amendment. Accessed April 6, 2019.
- Groening, Matt. “A Head in the Polls.” *Futurama*. Dir. Bret Haaland. Fox. March 3, 2002. Television.
- . “War Is the H-Word.” *Futurama*. Dir. Bret Haaland and Ron Hughhart. Fox. May 17, 2008. Television.
- Hall, Madison, et al. “702 People Have Been Charged in the Capitol Insurrection so Far. This Searchable Table Shows Them All.” *Insider*, Insider, November 22, 2021, www.insider.com/all-the-us-capitol-pro-trump-riot-arrests-charges-names-2021-1.
- Howard, Ron, dir. *Frost/Nixon*. New York, NY: Universal Pictures, 2008. DVD.

Just, Marion, and Ann Crigler. "Leadership Image-Building: After Clinton and Watergate." *Political Psychology* 21, no. 1 (2000): 179–98. www.jstor.org/stable/3792070. Accessed November 10, 2016.

Katz, Malcolm. "Classroom Implications of Watergate." *The Phi Delta Kappan* 55, no. 7 (1974): 465–67. www.jstor.org/stable/20297626. Accessed November 10, 2016

Kilpatrick, Carroll. "Nixon Tells Editors, 'I'm Not a Crook'". *The Washington Post*, November 18, 1973, www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/national/longterm/watergate/articles/111873-1.htm. Accessed October 13, 2016.

Moffat, Steven. "Day of the Moon." *Doctor Who*. Dir. Toby Haynes. BBC. October 7, 2012. Television.

Nixon, Richard Milhous. "Checkers Speech." Evergreen Valley College, *Media Services*, 1975. Recording.

Nixon, Richard. *The Watergate Interview*. By David Frost. CBS. California, May 5, 1977. Television. Transcript. www.nytimes.com/1977/05/05/archives/transcript-of-frosts-television-interview-with-nixon-about.html.

Nixon, Richard. *War at home and abroad*. By David Frost. CBS. California, May 19, 1977. Television. Transcript. www.nytimes.com/1977/05/05/archives/transcript-of-frosts-television-interview-with-nixon-about.html.

Pytalski, Jan. "Hundreds gather near White House to demand Mueller report release." *Reuters*. April 4, 2019. www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-trump-russia-demonstrations/us-rallies-scheduled-to-demand-release-of-full-mueller-report-idUSKCN1RG14Q. Accessed April 06, 2019.

"Richard M. Nixon, 36th Vice-President (1953-1961)." *United States Senate*, www.senate.gov/artandhistory/history/common/generic/VP_Richard_Nixon.htm. Accessed September 1, 2016.

Riechmann, Deb. "Nixon Urged Hiss Indictment." *The Washington Post*, October 13, 1999, www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/politics/feed/a52881-1999oct13.htm. Accessed June 10, 2017.

Schwartz, Richard D. "President's Message: After Watergate." *Law & Society Review* 8, no. 1 (1973): 3–5.

Sharman, Jim, dir. *The Rocky Horror Picture Show*. Los Angeles: CA, Twentieth Century Fox, 1975. DVD.

Singer, Bryan, dir. *X-Men: Days of Future Past*. Los Angeles: CA, Twentieth Century Fox, 2014. DVD.

Stone, Oliver, dir. *Nixon*. Santa Monica: CA, Cinergi Pictures Entertainment, 1995. DVD.

Tarantino, Quentin, dir. *Pulp Fiction*. Los Angeles, CA: Miramax, 1994. DVD.

“The Vice-president.” *The Nixon Library and Museum*, www.nixonlibrary.gov/thelife/apolitician/thevicepresident.php. Accessed August 31, 2016.

Zelizer, Barbie. *Covering the body: The Kennedy Assassination, the Media, and the Shaping of Collective Memory*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1992. Print.

Zemeckis, Robert, dir. *Contact*. 1997. Burbank, CA: Warner Bros., 2007. DVD.

Zemeckis, Robert, dir. *Forrest Gump*. Hollywood, CA: Paramount Pictures, 1994. DVD.

SABER QECHAI

The Smart City in a Digital World
Review on Mosco Vincent's *The Smart City in a Digital World*,
London: Emerald, 2019.

Pro&Contra 5

No. 2 (2021) 99–105

<https://doi.org/10.33033/pc.2021.2.99>

Mosco Vincent is a Canadian sociologist who received his doctorate in sociology from Harvard University in 1975. He is currently a professor at the University of Queen of Ontario in Canada. He was formerly chair of research in Communication and Society. Mosco is the author and editor of more than 200 articles or book chapters and 26 books on different topics, mainly on the political economy of communication, the future of cities, and the social impacts of information technology. His publications have been translated into many languages, including Chinese¹.

Through the quick evolution of information and communication technologies, a lot of researchers have tried to comprehend the impact of information technology on human life. Perspectives on the contribution of information and communication technologies to current global social change vary considerably. While optimistic researchers emphasize the decisive role of information and communication technologies in the development and modernization process of society, pessimistic researchers stress the continuing emergence and growth of the digital gap that causes inequalities internationally.

The writer, in *The Smart City in a Digital World*, clearly falls into the camp of the pessimists. He challenges the worldwide smart city movement, pointing out that the application of technologies in urban spaces increases monitoring, transfers urban governance to the hands of the business community, reduces transparency, and accelerates devastating climate change. In the author's words, *The Smart City in a Digital World* was one of the three works in an ongoing research project aiming to study the relationship between human society and technology. Contrary to its previous ones, *To the Cloud* (2014)² and *Becoming Digital* (2017)³, both of which focus primarily on historical descriptions of information and communication technologies, *The Smart City in a Digital World* presents the roadmap of the construction of urban areas within the new digital environment. Overall, it questions the current establishment of smart cities, a fashionable word that Mosco crucially dissects as another of the sublime visions, such as postmodern cities⁴ and garden cities,⁵ that continually pop up as urban mythologies.

¹ Dr. Vincent Mosco. Available on: <http://www.vincentmosco.com/about.html>, accessed on December 29, 2021.

² Mosco, *To the Cloud: Big Data in a Turbulent World*. Routledge, 2014.

³ Mosco, *Becoming Digital: Toward a Post-Internet Society (SocietyNow)*. Emerald Publishing, 2017.

⁴ Postmodern cities are meant not to shelter people but instead to entertain society.

⁵ The garden city is a model of urban planning which was characterized by progressive visions of solving the problems of rural-urban migration and the resulting disorderly growth of urban areas.

The book is divided into eight chapters that bring together his previous critical work on *After the Internet: Cloud Computing, Big Data and the Internet of Things*⁶, with a focus on the high-tech enterprises that manage the physical, social, and administrative transformations of the urban built environment. Chapters 1 and 2 provide a theoretical focus, depicting the context, research topic, core notions, and the book's analytical context. Chapters 3–6 examine the tangible formation of smart cities. In particular, the focus is on the technological implementations of smart cities and on exploring the different types of governance that characterize them. Chapter 7 looks at how smart cities are culturally constituted, while chapter 8 comes as the concluding section in which he outlines his thoughts and concerns about technologies and cities. Theoretically, the book points to attempts of Mosco to bring a critical outlook to challenging prevailing ideologies, most of which rely upon technology's transcendental power. Mosco's view of citizenship and local democracy for smart cities in the present work is critical of these technological determinists' instrumental rationality.

Mosco explains, within the first part of his book, the reasons behind his choice of cities as a research topic. He argues that cities are now the areas where democracy's promise has been fulfilled. He believes that cities are usually more cosmopolitan than the country-state, but still more closely aligned with the interests of typical citizens. The movement of the smart city globally has slightly expanded the power of privately held technological companies over cities since 2018. For this, Mosco is concerned that urban residents are in danger of being stripped of their communal democratic privileges as governance is turned over to the private sector, monitoring grows, and information about their personal life becomes something that can be marketed easily. This book is therefore about building resistance towards privacy, helping people retain control of their personal life, and ultimately preserving democracy within a digital world.

Thereafter, the writer demonstrates the smart city's social history concepts. In the words of Mosco, the smart city idea grew out of business needs. It emerged with the report of IBM⁷ in 2009 urging for making "smarter cities," making it one of the attempts of the company to create a new market after the financial crisis of 2008. During the initial phases of the development of smart cities, there were two identical approaches to the smart city. The first one was based on technology, which was backed by a number of scientists and many technology companies, establishing the metrics of smart city implementation by using smart new technologies only. The second one was citizenbased and was suggested by some socialists and officials to broaden the focus of the smart city idea

⁶ Mosco, *After the Internet: Cloud Computing, Big Data and the Internet of Things*. GRESEC, 2016, 146–155.

⁷ International Business Machines Corporation (IBM) is an American multinational technology company.

to include development and sustainability, people and technology, livability, and participatory governance. The writer examines how the technology-driven conception of smart city was developed with the expansion of information and communication technologies, how it progressively governed a substantial part of the discourse of smart city, and finally, how it drove the current smart city development context, broadly engaged with private enterprise tenets.

Subsequently, the focus shifts to examining the infrastructure of smart cities through technologies. The writer examines four tools that are essential to building smart cities: advanced telecommunications, cloud computing, big data analytics, and the Internet of Things. Mosco illustrates how these web-based systems are incorporated into the fabric of urban life and form the basis of smart cities, and also looks at the relationships of power that lie behind these technologies. The analysis suggests that non-elected private bodies are becoming more and more involved in the governance of urban spaces than the elected political authorities, as governments rely on the technological capacities of the private sector to deliver on the promise of smart cities.

The writer further looks at the issue of smart cities' governance. Mosco, by relying on worldwide case studies, differentiates between three forms of governance for smart cities: state-led, private business-led, and citizen-driven. More precisely, the writer examines state-led smart cities in India, China, and Singapore. For him, China stands out as a case in point because of its status as a nation with over 50% of the world's smart city projects. The writer describes China's smart city projects, ranging from the development of ancient cities to the establishment of totally new smart ones, and also looks at the proactive role of large technology companies in China (e.g., Huawei, Tencent, etc.) in setting up their plans for smart cities. Mosco argues that the large-scale investment by China in smart cities is meant to be seen as a portion of the larger strategy of the government to transition the country swiftly from a predominantly agriculture-based society to an information industrial society. The writer highlights that the main issue with state-led smart cities, like those in China, stems from the fact that ordinary people seldom can voice what they want and need.

In addition, the author explores some private smart city examples. He uses case studies from the United States to demonstrate an understanding of the process of situation that occurs when cities of the future are being created by private technology companies. He examines a few smart city projects run by large U.S. technology firms, ranging from the developed Silicon Valley to the Disney Florida project. At some point, he also comes up with the idea of a company town, referring to a private city operated not only for business purposes but as a business itself. As he notes, private firms are breaking new ground in making smart city projects cost-effective by pushing for the use of advertisements

across the infrastructure of the smart city. But seldom do they consider a smart city's resilience and durability. Consequently, business-controlled smart cities typically have severe transportation problems, huge crises in affordable housing, high wealth inequality, and are least ready to deal with climate change.

The writer then turns his attention to smart cities led by citizens. For him, Barcelona is the leading example of an emerging smart city, in which the involvement of citizens is pivotal. Barcelona's government, in response to strong public pressure, has chosen to renovate its infrastructure at a cost that is affordable and does not rely excessively on the private sector. Moreover, the city has also taken significant steps toward bringing technology and democracy closer together, turning the buzzword of digital democracy into tangible reality. The writer points to many examples, most notably the way in which the government of Barcelona emphasized that its citizens should have access to information when the city concluded its contract with Vodafone. Mosco also looks at citizen-driven initiatives in other cities such as in Seoul, Paris, and Amsterdam. He argues that these citizen-centered smart cities are good democratic replacements for the government and private sector-led smart city creation models. He also examines the potential climate change challenges that smart city projects will face, and he is concerned about that current smart city forms of governance will all be insufficient when it comes to climate change mitigation, because smart cities led by citizens, such as Barcelona, lack a feasible plan to build an energy-positive city.

Mosco then goes on to discuss some aspects of the smart city's cultural dimension. He asserts that smart cities do exist in physical devices, systems, apps, and policies; but more than that, they are also alive in the rhetoric, narratives, mythologies, and commerce that populate the urban fantasy. He starts by examining a series of speeches, mythologies, and fantasies regarding the potential future of the city. These encompass both Howard's garden city and Le Corbusier's modernist vision of the *Cité Radiense*, with its columnar and neo-baroque style buildings. The writer continues to show how the narrative of creative city development drives the beginning of the smart city imagination (getting the creative city narrative much deeper and broader with a rich view of smartness and creativity throughout the metropolis, including daily objects and humans), as well as the way technology companies constructed the discourse of creating the smart city as merely a quest for the proper digital implementations. He also looks at some possible strategies, including marketing and public relations tools that technology companies use to promote their smart city vision and get worldwide governments to support them.

Mosco concludes his book by describing a smart city manifesto. He again stresses the role of people in making a smart city. In fact, what makes cities smart is the shared experience and intelligence of both people who live and work in them, as well as those who

frequent them. Mosco predicts that the objective of smart city technology implementations is not to increase corporate power and profits or government control of its citizens, but rather to contribute to enhancing the life quality and abilities of those living in the city.

In brief, *The Smart City in a Digital World* is a highly thoughtful book, the fruit of Mosco's ongoing and sustained research on both technology and cities. The book is full of substantial experiential data, is frank in its analysis, dynamic in its construction, and lively in its insights. It is one of the most notable books on smart city scholarship in the last few years. Nevertheless, there remain plenty of questions to be answered, including a few that could provide a valuable basis for future research. In my opinion, the key questions that deserve answers are the following: What is the proper way to achieve a balance between dependence on technology and the necessity of allowing a city to develop naturally? What is needed to make people's resilience to the technology-driven smart city a source of inspiration? And what should be done to minimize the increase in government-led and businesscontrolled smart cities worldwide? In fact, as with all successful studies, both the questions raised and the ones already answered in *The Smart City in a Digital World* are equally important and worth some thought.

